

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION

B.P.J., by her next friend and mother,
HEATHER JACKSON

Plaintiff,

v.

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF
EDUCATION, HARRISON COUNTY BOARD
OF EDUCATION, WEST VIRGINIA
SECONDARY SCHOOL ACTIVITIES
COMMISSION, W. CLAYTON BURCH in his
official capacity as State Superintendent,
DORA STUTLER in her official capacity as
Harrison County Superintendent, and THE
STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA

Defendants

and

LAINY ARMISTEAD

Defendant-Intervenor.

Case No. 2:21-cv-00316

Hon. Joseph R. Goodwin

**STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA AND DEFENDANT-INTERVENOR LAINY ARMISTEAD'S
JOINT MOTION TO MAKE RULE 26(E) DISCLOSURE AS TO DR. CHAD CARLSON**

INTRODUCTION

Allowing biological males to compete in women's sports increases the injury risk for biological women. That's the expert opinion of Dr. Chad Carlson, a highly decorated sports medicine physician who has treated thousands of injured athletes. What's worse, Dr. Carlson testified that sports organizations are not tracking injuries caused by males playing women's sports, so the problem flies under the radar.

In his deposition, when asked whether he was aware of any injuries resulting from a biological male playing one of several specific sports, Dr. Carlson accurately responded that the lack of tracking prevented him from being familiar with any. But recently, Dr. Carlson has become aware of a female high-school volleyball athlete injured by a jump spike delivered by a player who identifies as transgender. Thus, it is his duty under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e) to supplement his response, and a supplemental declaration to that effect is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

Leave should be granted for Dr. Carlson to provide this supplement because the information presented relates directly to a question he was asked and the information was not available at the time of his deposition. Further, no one will be prejudiced, as there is ample time before trial for Plaintiffs to depose Dr. Carlson to ask any legitimate follow-up questions. Allowing Defendants to make this supplemental disclosure will ensure that Dr. Carlson can answer all questions posed to him truthfully at trial.

SUMMARY OF THE SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT

In his deposition on March 28, 2022, Dr. Carlson had the following exchange with counsel for B.P.J.:

Q: You wrote that (as read): "In fact, biologically male transgender athletes have competed in a wide range of high school, collegiate, and professional girls' or women's sports, including, at least,

basketball, soccer, volleyball, softball, lacrosse, and even women's tackle football."

And my question is, are you aware of any injuries that resulted from the participation of transgender girls and women in those sports?

A: And so my answer would be that's not adequately tracked, and so no, I'm not familiar.

Carlson Dep. Tr. 155:20–156:8, attached hereto as Exhibit B.

As explained in Dr. Carlson's proposed supplement, this answer was accurate at the time it was given. Ex. A. And, as Dr. Carlson repeatedly testified, injuries related to the participation of male athletes who participate in women's sports are not adequately tracked. Ex. B at 124:2–125:4, 154:12–156:16.

But Dr. Carlson has recently become aware of situation in North Carolina in which a female high-school volleyball player sustained head and neck injuries from a jump spike delivered by a player who identifies as transgender. Ex. A. Accordingly, were he asked the same question today that he was asked at his deposition, honesty would require him to answer that he is familiar with this situation.

LEGAL STANDARD

Rule 26(e)(1) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure requires parties to supplement expert disclosures "if the party learns that in some material respect the disclosure or response is incomplete." Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e)(1). Rule 26(e)(2) extends this obligation to "information given during the expert's deposition." Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e)(2).

Supplementation is permissible when "the supplemental information correspond[s] to a prior Rule 26(a) disclosure" and the supplemental information was not "available at the time set for the initial disclosure." *In re C.R. Bard, Inc. Pelvic Repair Sys. Prods. Liab. Litig.*, MDL No. 2:14-cv-02528, 2017 WL 4248809, at *2 (S.D.W. Va. Sept. 25, 2017). Further, supplementation should be timely, based on

the “availability of the supplemental information.” *Id.* All three criteria are met here.

ARGUMENT

The proposed supplement (I) is directly responsive to a question Dr. Carlson was asked in his deposition and (II) was not available at the time of the deposition. Further, this supplement is (III) presented in a timely fashion with ample time for Plaintiffs to depose Dr. Carlson on the supplement if they so desire. Therefore, Defendants’ motion for leave to provide a supplemental disclosure should be granted.

I. The supplement is directly responsive to a question Dr. Carlson was asked at his deposition.

All Defendants seek is to disclose that Dr. Carlson’s answer to a deposition question has changed based on an injury that had not occurred or been reported on at the time of his deposition. That is precisely what Rule 26(e)(2) requires to avoid surprising B.P.J. with a different response at trial. Thus, the proposed supplement “correspond[s] to a prior Rule 26(a) disclosure” and should therefore be allowed. *In re C.R. Bard*, 2017 WL 4248809, at *2 (quoting *Carillo v. B&J Andrews Enters., LLC*, No. 2:11-cv-01450-RCJ-CWH, 2013 WL 420401, at *4 (D. Nev. Jan. 31, 2013)).

II. The supplement is based on an injury that had not occurred at the time of the deposition.

Dr. Carlson became familiar with the high-school student’s injury when it was reported in major media outlets in late October 2022. Ex. A. The information was therefore not available at the time of his deposition in March 2022.

Supplementation of an expert report is appropriate—indeed, required—when the expert receives new information not available at the time of the initial report. *See, e.g., OmniSource Corp. v. Heat Wave Metal Processing, Inc.*, No. 5:13-cv-772-D, 2015 WL 3452918, at *10 (E.D.N.C. May 29, 2015) (“[Defendant’s] supplement is proper because it is based on new information.”); *Kulock v. Nev. Dep’t of Tansp.*, No.

3:19-cv-00369-LRH-CLB, 2020 WL 7081582, at *2 (D. Nev. Dec. 2, 2020) (“New information . . . is the proper subject of supplementation.”). Accordingly, the proposed supplement is proper.

III. The supplement is timely, as there is more than adequate time for any follow-up questions B.P.J. may have

“Rule 26(e) does not limit the time for supplementation to the discovery period.” *Carillo*, 2013 WL 420401, at *4. Rather, Rule 26(e)(2) requires supplementation before the disclosure of Defendants’ Rule 26(a)(3) disclosures, which are not yet due. Thus, the proposed supplement is timely.

Moreover, the supplement is offered within weeks of the news of the North Carolina injury being carried by major news outlets. And it is offered more than two months before trial with ample time for B.P.J. to depose Dr. Carlson and ask any follow-up questions counsel may have based on the supplement.¹ Such a deposition would be easy to schedule and conduct, as the two-page supplement corrects Dr. Carlson’s answer to exactly one deposition question. No prejudice arises from allowing Dr. Carlson to answer this question honestly based on new information.

CONCLUSION

Rule 26(e)(2) specifically requires expert witnesses to supplement when their answer to a deposition question changes. Here, Dr. Carlson’s answer to a deposition question has changed because of his familiarity with an injury that occurred months after his deposition. Defendants should therefore be permitted to follow Rule 26(e)(2) by disclosing this new information.

¹ Defendants will work with Plaintiffs’ counsel to make Dr. Carlson available for a deposition on his supplemental report at a mutually agreeable time.

Respectfully submitted this 18th day of November, 2022.

PATRICK MORRISEY
West Virginia Attorney General

/s/ Brandon S. Steele
Brandon Steele, WV Bar No. 12423
Joshua D. Brown, WV Bar No. 12652
The Law Offices of Brandon S. Steele
3049 Robert C. Byrd Drive, Suite 100
Beckley, WV 25801
(304) 253-1230
(304) 255-1520 Fax
bstelelawoffice@gmail.com
joshua_brown05@hotmail.com

Jonathan Scruggs, AZ Bar No.
030505*
Roger G. Brooks, NC Bar No. 16317*
Henry W. Frampton, IV, SC Bar No.
75314*
Alliance Defending Freedom
15100 N. 90th Street
Scottsdale, AZ 85260
(480) 444-0020
(480) 444-0028 Fax
jscruggs@adflegal.org
rbrooks@adflegal.org
hframpton@adflegal.org

Christiana Holcomb, DC Bar No.
176922*
Alliance Defending Freedom
440 First Street NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20001
(202) 393-8690
(202) 347-3622 Fax
cholcomb@adflegal.org

/s/ Curtis R. A. Capehart
Douglas P. Buffington II (WV Bar # 8157)
Chief Deputy Attorney General
Curtis R.A. Capehart (WV Bar # 9876)
Deputy Attorney General
OFFICE OF THE WEST VIRGINIA ATTORNEY
GENERAL
State Capitol Complex
1900 Kanawha Blvd. E, Building 1, Room
E-26
Charleston, WV 25305-0220
Telephone: (304) 558-2021
Facsimile: (304) 558-0140
Email: curtis.r.a.capehart@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Defendant, STATE OF WEST
VIRGINIA*

(signatures continued on next page)

Tyson C. Langhofer, VA Bar No.
95204*

Rachel A. Csutoros, MA Bar No.
706225*

Alliance Defending Freedom
44180 Riverside Parkway
Lansdowne, VA 20176
(571) 707-2119
(571) 707-4790 Fax
tlanghofer@adflegal.org
rcsutoros@adflegal.org

Travis C. Barham, GA Bar No.
753251*

Alliance Defending Freedom
1000 Hurricane Shoals Road NE, Ste
D-1100
Lawrenceville, GA 30043
(770) 339-0774
(770) 339-0774 Fax
tbarham@adflegal.org

Timothy D. Ducar, AZ Bar No.
015307*

Law Offices of Timothy D. Ducar, PLC
7430 E. Butherus Drive, Suite E
Scottsdale, AZ 85260
(480) 502-2119
(480) 452-0900 Fax
tducar@azlawyers.com

**Visiting Attorneys
Attorneys for Defendant-Intervenor*

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION

B.P.J, by her next friend and mother,
HEATHER JACKSON

Plaintiff,

v.

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF
EDUCATION, HARRISON COUNTY BOARD
OF EDUCATION, WEST VIRGINIA
SECONDARY SCHOOL ACTIVITIES
COMMISSION, W. CLAYTON BURCH in his
official capacity as State Superintendent,
DORA STUTLER in her official capacity as
Harrison County Superintendent, and THE
STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA

Defendants

v.

LAINY ARMISTEAD

Defendant-Intervenor.

Case No. 2:21-cv-00316

Hon. Joseph R. Goodwin

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on November 18th, 2022, I electronically filed a true and exact copy of the foregoing with the Clerk of Court and all parties using the CM/ECF system.

/s/ Brandon S. Steele
Brandon Steele, WV Bar No. 12423
The Law Offices of Brandon S. Steele
3049 Robert C. Byrd Drive, Suite 100
Beckley, WV 25801
(304) 253-1230
(304) 255-1520 Fax
bsteelelawoffice@gmail.com

Attorney for Defendant-Intervenor

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

B.P.J., by her next friend and mother,
HEATHER JACKSON,

Plaintiff,

vs.

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF
EDUCATION; HARRISON COUNTY BOARD
OF EDUCATION; WEST VIRGINIA
SECONDARY SCHOOLS ACTIVITIES
COMMISSION; W. CLAYTON BURCH, in his
official capacity as State Superintendent, DORA
STUTLER, in her official capacity as the
Harrison County Superintendent, and the
STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA,

Defendants,

and

LAINY ARMISTEAD,

Defendant-Intervenor.

Case No. 2:21-cv-00316

Hon. Joseph R. Goodwin

SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF CHAD T. CARLSON, M.D., FACSM

During my deposition of March 28, 2022, Counsel for B.P.J. and I had the following exchange.

Q: You wrote that (as read): “In fact, biologically male transgender athletes have competed in a wide range of high school, collegiate, and professional girls’ or women’s sports, including, at least, basketball, soccer, volleyball, softball, lacrosse, and even women’s tackle football.”

And my question is, are you aware of any injuries that resulted from the participation of transgender girls and women in those sports?

A: And so my answer would be that's not adequately tracked, and so no, I'm not familiar.

My answer to the question was correct when given. Recently, I have become aware of a situation in which a female high-school volleyball player in Cherokee County, North Carolina, received head and neck injuries from a jump spike delivered by an athlete who identifies as transgender. This incident has received national media attention, and contemporaneous video footage that I find reasonably reliable to depict the jump spike and the description of the injury has been publicly released. I have monitored the news for the past couple of weeks to see if any further reporting or retractions would change the information reported, and I have seen nothing along those lines. So were I asked the same question today that I was asked on March 28, 2022, I would respond that I am familiar with an injury in high-school athletics caused by a volleyball spike to the head, delivered by an athlete who identifies as transgender.

I, Dr. Chad Carlson, pursuant to 28 U.S. Code § 1746, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the facts contained in this Supplemental Declaration of Chad T. Carlson, M.D., FACSM are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief, and that the opinions expressed therein represent my own expert opinions.

Executed on November 18, 2022.


Chad T. Carlson

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION

)
B.P.J. by her next friend and)
mother, HEATHER JACKSON,)
)
Plaintiff,)

No. 2:21-cv-00316

vs.)

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF)
EDUCATION, HARRISON COUNTY)
BOARD OF EDUCATION, WEST)
VIRGINIA SECONDARY SCHOOL)
ACTIVITIES COMMISSION, W.)
CLAYTON BURCH in his official)
capacity as State)
Superintendent, DORA STUTLER,)
in her official capacity as)
Harrison County)
Superintendent, and THE STATE)
OF WEST VIRGINIA,)

Defendants.)

LAINIEY ARMISTEAD,)
)
Defendant-Intervenor.)

REMOTE VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF
CHAD T. CARLSON, M.D., FACSM
Monday, March 28, 2022
Volume I

Reported by:
ALEXIS KAGAY
CSR No. 13795
Job No. 5122881
PAGES 1 - 227

1 imparted risk on an athletic field.

2 Q And there's no peer-reviewed study looking at
3 prepubertal kids and their -- boys and their
4 imparted risk on an athletic field, is there?

5 A That's why I was retained. 11:50:18

6 Q Okay. And there's no peer-reviewed study
7 looking at transgender women and their risk to other
8 women from participating in an athletic field;
9 right?

10 MR. FRAMPTON: Object to the form. 11:50:30

11 Go ahead.

12 THE WITNESS: There are multiple studies that
13 show retention of significant differences in the
14 types of things that would lead to disparities in
15 strength, power, speed, etcetera, all of which can 11:50:47
16 contribute to heightened injury risk, which was the
17 underpinning of World Rugby's finding.

18 BY MR. BLOCK:

19 Q Right. But --

20 MR. BLOCK: Can you read back my question, 11:50:58
21 Court Reporter.

22 (Record read.)

23 MR. FRAMPTON: Same objection.

24 MR. TRYON: Objection; form.

25 THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, there has been 11:51:21

1 no peer-reviewed study looking at the injury risk
2 that exists to cisgender women when transgender
3 women cross over and play. That issue is, to my
4 knowledge, not often tracked.

5 BY MR. BLOCK: 11:51:45

6 Q Can we look at page 2 of your report.

7 A Which report are you talking about?

8 Q Your -- your February report.

9 MR. FRAMPTON: I'm sorry, Josh, what -- what
10 page did you tell him to go to? 11:52:05

11 MR. BLOCK: Page 2. Exhibit --

12 MR. TRYON: Which exhibit is this, please?

13 MR. BLOCK: 80. Exhibit 80.

14 THE WITNESS: Okay.

15 BY MR. BLOCK: 11:52:26

16 Q If you look at the -- the final sentence, at
17 the bottom, that begins with "As a medical doctor."

18 A Okay.

19 Q It says (as read):

20 "As a medical doctor who has spent 11:52:32

21 my career in sports medicine, it is

22 my opinion that World Rugby's

23 assessment of the evidence is

24 scientifically sound, and that

25 injury modeling meaningfully 11:52:41

1 put on those bones?

2 A There is an association there.

3 Q It's just an association?

4 A They play against each other. Large muscle
5 mass creates greater bone mineralization too, just 12:43:05
6 from the tug of the muscles on bones. So there's an
7 association, yes.

8 Q Let's go to page? Page 1 of your report.

9 A Which report are we talking about?

10 Q Your -- your February report. 12:43:34

11 A Okay.

12 Q The final sentence of this first paragraph,
13 you say (as read):

14 "And in fact, biologically male
15 transgender athletes have competed 12:43:53
16 in a wide range of high school,
17 collegiate, and professional girls'
18 or women's sports, including, at
19 least, basketball, soccer,
20 volleyball, softball, lacrosse, and 12:44:01
21 even women's tackle football."

22 Correct?

23 A That's what that says.

24 Q Okay. Are you aware of any injuries
25 resulting from their participation in those sports? 12:44:11

1 A I'm not -- I'm not --

2 MR. BLOCK: I think Mr. Carlson froze.

3 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Yeah, just -- we should
4 pause a sec.

5 (Technical issues.) 12:44:32

6 THE WITNESS: Because it's not adequately --
7 Sorry, I don't know if it's when I go to look
8 at the document or what, but -- can you see me now?

9 BY MR. BLOCK:

10 Q You'll have to answer that again. 12:44:39

11 So are you aware of any injuries that have
12 resulted from the participation of those transgender
13 athletes?

14 A This issue is inadequately tracked, so no,
15 I'm not aware. 12:44:57

16 Q Okay.

17 A Well, actually, that's not true.

18 Rephrase your question. I want to make sure
19 I'm understanding it.

20 Q You wrote that (as read): 12:45:08

21 "In fact, biologically male
22 transgender athletes have competed
23 in a wide range of high school,
24 collegiate, and professional girls'
25 or women's sports, including, at

12:45:15

1 least, basketball, soccer,
2 volleyball, softball, lacrosse, and
3 even women's tackle football."

4 And my question is, are you aware of any
5 injuries that resulted from the participation of 12:45:25
6 transgender girls and women in those sports?

7 A And so my answer would be that's not
8 adequately tracked, and so no, I'm not familiar.

9 Q Are you aware of any evidence that the
10 participation of transgender women in these events 12:45:40
11 actually has increased the frequency and severity of
12 injury suffered by such gender female athletes?

13 A You're speaking to those sports listed?

14 Q Yes.

15 A Again, it's inadequately tracked, so I'm not 12:46:01
16 familiar.

17 Q And let's go to paragraph 47 of that
18 document, the same document. Page 27, paragraph 47.

19 A Page 27, you said?

20 Q Yeah. In paragraph 47, at the bottom. 12:46:29

21 A Okay.

22 Q It says (as read):

23 "In 2014, a male mixed-martial art
24 fighter identifying as female and
25 fighting under the name Fallon Fox 12:46:40