

Exhibit 5

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

JANE DOE 1, JANE DOE 2,) Civil Action
JANE DOE 3, JANE DOE 4,) No. 17-cv-1597 (CKK)
JANE DOE 5, JOHN DOE 1,)
REGAN V. KIBBY, and)
DYLAN KOHERE,)

Plaintiffs,)

v.)

DONALD J. TRUMP, in his)
official capacity as)
President of the)
United States; et al.,)

Defendants.)

-----)
Complete caption on Page 2.

- - -
Thursday, February 1, 2018
- - -

Deposition of MARTIE SOPER, taken at the offices
of Foley Hoag LLP, 1717 K Street NW, Washington, D.C.,
beginning at 9:13 a.m., before Nancy J. Martin, a
Registered Merit Reporter, Certified Shorthand
Reporter.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
Civil Case No. 17-cv-1597 (CKK)

JANE DOE 1, JANE DOE 2, JANE DOE 3,)
JANE DOE 4, JANE DOE 5, JOHN DOE 1,)
REGAN V. KIBBY, and DYLAN KOHERE,)

Plaintiffs,)

v.)

DONALD J. TRUMP, in his official)
capacity as President of the)
United States; JAMES N. MATTIS, in his)
official capacity as Secretary of)
Defense; JOSEPH F. DUNFORD, JR., in his)
official capacity as Chairman of the)
Joint Chiefs of Staff; the)
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY;)
RYAN D. MCCARTHY, in his official)
capacity as Secretary of the Army;)
the UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE)
NAVY; RICHARD V. SPENCER, in his)
official capacity as Secretary of the)
Navy; the UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF)
THE AIR FORCE; HEATHER A. WILSON, in)
her official capacity as Secretary of)
the Air Force; the UNITED STATES)
COAST GUARD; ELAINE C. DUKE, in her)
official capacity as Secretary of)
Homeland Security; the DEFENSE HEALTH)
AGENCY; RAQUEL C. BONO, in her official)
capacity as Director of the Defense)
Health Agency; and the)
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,)

Defendants.)

-----)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

FOLEY HOAG LLP
BY: CLAIRE LAPORTE, ATTORNEY AT LAW
LAUREN GODLES MILGROOM, ATTORNEY AT LAW
TRACY ROOSEVELT, ATTORNEY AT LAW
1717 K Street NW
Washington, D.C. 20006
(202) 223-1200
claporte@foleyhoag.com
lmilgroom@foleyhoag.com
troosevelt@foleyhoag.com
Representing Plaintiffs

NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN RIGHTS
BY: ALEXANDER L. CHEN, ESQ.
SHANNON MINTER, ESQ.
870 Market Street
Suite 370
San Francisco, California 94102
(415) 365-1335
achen@nclrights.org
sminter@nclrights.org
Representing Plaintiffs

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP
BY: HARRISON WHITE, ESQ.
355 South Grand Avenue
Los Angeles, California 90071
(213) 485-1234
harrison.white@lw.com
Representing Plaintiffs

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
BY: KEVIN M. LAMB, ESQ.
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006
(202) 663-6249
kevin.lamb@wilmerhale.com
Representing the Plaintiffs

1 A P P E A R A N C E S :

2

3

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

4

BY: PETER KOMOROWSKI III, ESQ.

One City Center

850 Tenth Street N.W.

5

Washington, D.C. 20001

(202) 662-5780

6

pkomorowski@cov.com

Representing the Plaintiffs

7

8

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

9

CIVIL DIVISION

10

BY: RYAN BRADLEY PARKER, ESQ.

ANDREW E. CARMICHAEL, ESQ.

MATTHEW SKURNIK, ESQ.

11

20 Massachusetts Avenue N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20001

12

(202) 514-4336

ryan.parker@usdoj.gov

13

andrew.e.carmichael@usdoj.gov

matthew.skurnik@usdoj.gov

14

15

16

ALSO PRESENT:

17

18

COLONEL LAURA BARCHICK, USAF JAG

19

LT. COLONEL FELIX SUTANTO, USAF JAG

20

LT. COLONEL CHARLES GARTLAND, USAF JAG

21

22

23

24

25

1	I N D E X		
2			PAGE
3			9
4	E X H I B I T S		
5	NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	MARKED
6	Exhibit 1	Organizational Chart, 1 page	20
7	Exhibit 2	TRICARE Web Page, 2 pages	48
8	Exhibit 3	Memorandum for Secretaries of the Military Departments, Transgender Service Members, 1 page	51
9			
10	Exhibit 4	E-mail dated September 4, 2015, NAVY_00001441 - 1447, 7 pages	52
11			
12	Exhibit 5	Memorandum dated June 30, 2016, Directive-type Memorandum (DTM) 16-005, Military Service of Transgender Members, 6 pages	88
13			
14	Exhibit 6	E-mail chain, NAVY_00001778 - 1779, 2 pages	93
15			
16	Exhibit 7	MMDT Case Review Meeting, March 9, 2017, USDOE 1868 - -1894, 29 pages	117
17			
18	Exhibit 8	DOD Instruction 1300.28, In-Service Transition for Transgender Service Members, 18 pages	120
19			
20	Exhibit 9	Memorandum for Distribution, Air Force Policy Management for In-Service Transition for Airmen Identifying on Transgender, 17 pages	121
21			
22	Exhibit 10	E-mail dated June 23, 2017, USDOE3662 - -3663, 2 pages	142
23			
24	Exhibit 11	E-mail string, USDOE19127 - 19132, 6 pages	146
25			

E X H I B I T S		
NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	MARKED
1 2 3	Exhibit 12 Transgender Awareness Training All Airmen) 2017, DOE2626 - DOE2657, 32 pages	150
4 5 6	Exhibit 13 Memorandum for Secretaries of the Military Departments, Chiefs of the Military Services, 1705250200, 1 page	158
7 8	Exhibit 14 E-mail string, AF8243 - 8274, 32 pages	162
9 10	Exhibit 15 E-mail string, USDOE3284 - -3288, 5 pages	163
11 12	Exhibit 16 E-mail dated June 22, 2017, USDOE8143 - USDOE8150, 8 pages	165
13 14	Exhibit 17 Memorandum, Accession of Transgender Individuals into the Military Services, June 30, 2017, 1 page	167
15 16	Exhibit 18 E-mail from Lieutenant Colonel Aaron Wellman, USDOE9574 - -9576, 3 pages	170
17 18	Exhibit 19 E-mail dated July 25, 2017, USDOE2543, 1 page	175
19 20	Exhibit 20 Donald J. Trump, Tweets, July 26, 2017, DOE 1969, 1 page	176
21 22	Exhibit 21 E-mail dated July 27, 2017, USDOE5531, 1 page	178
23 24	Exhibit 22 E-mail dated August 7, 2017, USDOE1895, 1 page	180
25	Exhibit 23 E-mail string, USDOE1413 - -1416, 4 pages	183
	Exhibit 24 E-mail dated August 2, 2017, USDOE3207 - 3208, 2 pages	186

E X H I B I T S		
NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	MARKED
1 2 3	Exhibit 25 E-mail string, August 3, 2017, USDOE1800 - 1803, 4 pages	188
4 5	Exhibit 26 E-mail string, USDE4294 - -4296, 3 pages	190
6 7	Exhibit 27 Presidential Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense and the Secretary of Homeland Security, August 25, 2017, 5 pages	192
8 9	Exhibit 28 Memorandum, Military Service by Transgender Individuals - Interim Guidance, 2 pages	193
10 11	Exhibit 29 Panel of Experts - Transgender Policy Review 2017, 12 pages	198
12 13	Exhibit 30 E-mail string, USDOE4539 - -4560, 4 pages	211
14 15	Exhibit 31 Memo for ALMAJCOM/SGAL.MTF/CC, October 17, 2017, USDOE2061, 1 page	214
16 17	Exhibit 32 E-mail dated October 31, 2017, USDOE5244 - 5248, 5 pages	217
18 19	Exhibit 33 E-mail string, USDOE529 - -530, 2 pages	219
20 21	Exhibit 34 Data Extracts, Key Information used by the Panel to make recommendations, USDOE8711 - -8729, 19 pages	222
22 23	Exhibit 35 Health Data on Active Duty Service Members with Gender Dysphoria, December 13, 2017, USDOE2633 - -2664, 32 pages	225
24 25	Exhibit 36 E-mail dated November 22, 2017, USDOE1783 - -1784, 2 pages	232

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

E X H I B I T S

NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	MARKED
Exhibit 37	Memorandum, December 8, 2017, WA-ADD-0043 - -0049, 7 pages	233
Exhibit 38	Memorandum, December 14, 2017, USDOE9191 - 9193, 3 pages	234
Exhibit 39	Potential Questions for Recruiters Concerning Transgender Accessions, USDOE1357 - -1358, 2 pages	235
Exhibit 40	E-mail from Major McWhorter, 3 pages	242

1 WASHINGTON, D.C., THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 1, 2018;

2 9:31 A.M.

3 - - -

4 MARTIE SOPER,

5 having been first duly sworn,

6 was examined and testified as follows:

7

8 EXAMINATION

9 BY MS. LAPORTE:

10 Q. All right, Ms. Soper. Good morning.

11 A. Good morning.

12 Q. And thank you for making yourself available
13 today.

14 Have you ever had your deposition taken
15 before?

16 A. No, ma'am.

17 Q. Okay. Well, let me explain a little bit
18 about how it's going to go because it's quite
19 different from an ordinary conversation.

20 During the deposition I'll be asking you
21 questions, and you, hopefully, will be answering them,
22 and our stenographer will be recording everything that
23 either one of us says.

24 And what that means is that it's important
25 that we not talk over each other. So if you could

1 please wait until I finish asking my question before
2 you begin answering it, that would be good.

3 If you don't understand any of my questions
4 or need me to restate one of them in a clearer way,
5 please let me know. All right?

6 A. Yes, ma'am.

7 Q. Okay. Great. Thank you.

8 The other thing is that, obviously, since
9 you're having to answer all these questions, your
10 comfort and ability to focus is important to us. So
11 if at any point you feel that you need a break, please
12 let us know.

13 A. Yes, ma'am. Thank you.

14 Q. I also need breaks on a regular basis. So I
15 may be the one who initiates them, but I just wanted
16 you to know that you are not required to sit there if
17 you feel that you need a break.

18 A. Thank you.

19 Q. Just please don't take a break after I've
20 asked a question and before you answer it. Okay?

21 A. Yes, ma'am.

22 Q. Okay. Excellent.

23 So let me just start out by asking you a
24 little bit about your background. When did you
25 graduate from college?

1 A. I graduated from Lowell General School of
2 Nursing in 1982.

3 Q. Okay. And did you do any further educational
4 training after that?

5 A. Yes, ma'am. I have done some follow-on
6 training. I graduated from Troy University with a
7 bachelor's in health services administration in 2005,
8 and then I continued on with a master's in emergency
9 management in 2007.

10 Q. Okay. And have you had any other -- attended
11 any other degree programs since those ones?

12 A. No, ma'am, not civilian degree programs. I
13 have taken several military educational programs,
14 professional development courses.

15 Q. Okay. So after you graduated from the Lowell
16 Nursing School in 1982, what was your -- what has your
17 professional pathway been since then?

18 A. My pathway has been -- I graduated from
19 Lowell general, and I started -- actually, at that
20 time there was an abundance of nurses. So there
21 wasn't a nursing shortage. So I ended up working in a
22 nursing home in a local town and had to wait for a
23 position to open up in one of the local hospitals.

24 And I began working -- I don't remember the
25 order of which of the hospitals I started at, but I

1 started at either National Memorial Hospital or
2 St. Joseph's Hospital in Nashua in the critical care
3 unit -- cardiac critical care.

4 And from there my career had been majorly in
5 cardiac critical care. I went down to Boston and
6 worked at Mass General and did critical care at Mass
7 General, and then I ventured out a little bit and I
8 did some pediatric burn trauma training, and I worked
9 at Shiners Burn Center in Boston for about five years.

10 And then I ended up moving down to
11 Connecticut and worked at Yale, New Haven in the
12 cardio critical care unit there.

13 Q. Okay. And did you work at Yale, New Haven
14 until you began your military career?

15 A. No. I actually started my military career in
16 1991, and I believe I was working at Mass General at
17 the time. No. I'm sorry. I was working at
18 St. Joe's -- or National Memorial Hospital in Nashua,
19 New Hampshire at the time.

20 Q. Okay. So did you combine the work that you
21 were doing that you have just been describing with
22 initiating a military career?

23 A. Yes, ma'am.

24 Q. Okay. So you had things running in two
25 tracks?

1 A. Yes, ma'am.

2 Q. Okay. And when did your military career
3 start?

4 A. I sought to join the Air Force Reserve in
5 1991 during the first Gulf War, Desert Shield/Desert
6 Storm, and I went to the recruiters to find out what I
7 could do. Having a critical care background, I like
8 that pace of nursing and I like that type of care. So
9 I wanted to do something different other than just,
10 you know, hospital nursing.

11 I have a love of flying. So I wanted explore
12 being a flight nurse in the Air Force Reserves. So I
13 went to the recruiters. They told me it would take
14 about eight months for the commissioning process to
15 occur, which it did. So in September of '91 I was
16 commissioned into the Air Force Reserve as a flight
17 nurse.

18 Q. Okay. And how long did you serve in the
19 Air Force Reserve?

20 A. For 23 years.

21 Q. So September '91 until about 2004?

22 A. No. To October of 2014.

23 Q. 2014. Sorry. I guess I got my math wrong
24 here.

25 So all right. And so you were in the Reserve

1 the entire time from 1991 to 2014?

2 A. Yes, ma'am.

3 Q. And so did you continue to have civilian jobs
4 all during that time?

5 A. I did. My civilian career in the hospital
6 environment went through 1997.

7 Q. Okay. And what were the institutions that
8 you worked at after Yale, New Haven, if any?

9 A. Well, that was in 1997 that -- my position
10 within my Reserve unit was a trainer. Because of my
11 background in critical care, I did a lot of training
12 for the unit in cardiac critical care using EKG
13 monitors, defibrillators and things like that. I was
14 asked to become the training manager for the squadron,
15 which is a full-time civil service position.

16 So in 1997 I left the civilian hospital
17 environment and put a package in to be hired as a
18 GS-11 for my Reserve unit at Westover.

19 Q. Okay. And have you served full time in some
20 capacity for the Air Force ever since 1997?

21 A. Yes, ma'am.

22 Q. Okay. So can you give me, then, your
23 trajectory within the Air Force starting with 1997.

24 A. Yes, ma'am. I was -- so I was hired as a
25 GS-11 and was the air crew training manager at

1 Westover --

2 REPORTER MARTIN: As what?

3 THE WITNESS: Air crew training manager or,
4 you know, training -- the position is what they call
5 an "air reserve technician." So it was an ART nurse.
6 And my duties were to manage the training for the
7 squadron for all unit members, as well as my reserve
8 position is the air corps training manager. So when
9 you have a civil service position for a reserve unit,
10 you're dual-hatted because the Reserves just don't
11 operate on a weekend basis. They have a full-time
12 staff that operates Monday through Friday because
13 there's a lot of work that needs to be done in
14 preparation for the monthly drills or any other
15 training activities that occur during the month or
16 during the week.

17 So my full-time job is preparing for the
18 weekend drills. If we had to deploy people or people
19 had to come in for traditional training, being a
20 flying squadron we were required to come to our
21 weekend drills, but on every other weekend we had to
22 fly. So our flight training requirements were in
23 addition to our just regular drill weekends.

24 So my position was scheduling flights, making
25 sure people -- we had enough crew members, making sure

1 training packets were developed and everything to make
2 the mission training a success. So I did that until
3 1999.

4 BY MS. LAPORTE:

5 Q. Okay. And what did you do starting in 1999?

6 A. I was asked to go down to Dobbins Air Reserve
7 Base and take a position as the -- setting up the very
8 first STAN-EVAL section for flight nurses and med
9 techs at 22nd Air Force.

10 Q. The very first what?

11 A. It's the chief of -- chief flight nurses
12 STAN-EVAL, standards and evaluations. So that's the
13 division for the flyers that go and do check rides, if
14 you will, for flight nurses and med techs within our
15 respective numbered Air Force.

16 Q. Okay. And so how long were you at Dobbins?

17 A. I -- full time at Dobbins. I was there until
18 2007.

19 Q. And what did you do starting in 2007?

20 A. I was asked to go down and become a commander
21 of an air vac squad down at McDill.

22 Q. And how long did you serve in that capacity?

23 A. I was -- until 2009, and then I returned back
24 to Dobbins for another position. I had been promoted
25 while I was down at McDill, and then I was asked to

1 come and fill a position that was becoming vacant back
2 at Dobbins in a different capacity.

3 Q. And what was that?

4 A. That was the director of AE operation, air
5 medical evacuation operations.

6 Q. Okay. And how long did you serve at McDill
7 in that capacity?

8 A. I served as the commander from 2007 until
9 2009, and then I was -- as a GS employee. I did have
10 a break in my GS position from the time I went from
11 Dobbins to the time I went from McDill. So I had a
12 break in my civil service capacity because of working
13 full time for the Air Force. I was on orders.

14 So I went to McDill until 2009. Went back to
15 Dobbins from 2009 until 2010.

16 Q. Okay. And what happened next?

17 A. I was asked to go to Pope Air Force Base to
18 stand up the first air medical evacuation formal
19 training unit.

20 Q. And what was the period in which you worked
21 on that?

22 A. From 2010 to 2012.

23 Q. What was your next posting?

24 A. My next posting was I was asked to take an
25 AGR position, an active guard reserve position. It's

1 a three- to four-year active duty tour at the
2 Pentagon, and become the medical director for OSD
3 Reserve Affairs.

4 Q. What were the years in which you served as
5 the medical director for OSD Reserve Affairs?

6 A. I served from 2012 until I retired. I
7 retired from the Air Force Reserve in that position.
8 So October 2014.

9 Q. Did you continue to be attached to the
10 Air Force during the time that you were the medical
11 director?

12 A. When you go on an AGR tour, you actually -- I
13 don't want to say "resign" but -- forgive me. I don't
14 know the correct term, but I give up my affiliation
15 with the Air Force Reserve, and I had to take a leave
16 of absence from my civil service position to take this
17 active duty tour. So now I'm actually on the active
18 duty books as a member of the active duty force.

19 So, yes, your question is -- I did give up my
20 affiliation with the reserve during that time, but I
21 was still affiliated with the Air Force.

22 Q. Okay. All right. So when you retired in
23 2014, what was your next step?

24 A. My next step was applying for the position
25 that I currently have right now as the assistant

1 deputy for health policy for the Air Force.

2 Q. And what are your responsibilities in that
3 job?

4 A. My responsibilities cover the management and
5 oversight for all healthcare policy matters for the
6 Air Force. That's a very broad position.

7 Q. At some point during all of the different
8 jobs, responsibilities, postings, whatever you would
9 call them that you've had, did you acquire any kind of
10 expertise in matters relating to transgender health?

11 A. I started becoming familiar about transgender
12 health during my position here with the -- with
13 staff -- with my Air Force position right now, yes,
14 ma'am.

15 Q. So, in other words, starting when you were an
16 assistant deputy for health policy?

17 A. Correct. With my current position. Yes,
18 ma'am.

19 Q. And what was it that got you involved in
20 looking into health issues of transgender people?

21 A. Actually, it was following the release of
22 Secretary Carter's statement in 2015.

23 Q. Okay. I'm going to come back to that.

24 A. Okay.

25 MS. LAPORTE: So I'd like to start out, as

1 I'm sure you've already managed to figure out, we, on
2 the plaintiffs' side here, are not too hugely expert
3 about how the military is structured. And so we'd
4 like to get some information from you about how health
5 affairs fit into the rest of the structure.

6 So what I'd like to do is mark this as the
7 first exhibit.

8 (Deposition Exhibit 1 was marked for
9 identification.)

10 BY MS. LAPORTE:

11 Q. So, Ms. Soper, you should have in front of
12 you something marked Exhibit 1, which contains a
13 couple of organizational charts. Can you -- well, let
14 me ask you first: There's one at the top that is in
15 color with gray and black, and it starts with
16 "Secretary of Defense" and goes down all the way to
17 the bottom right to "MTS." Do you see that?

18 A. Yes, ma'am.

19 Q. And is this organizational chart accurate as
20 far as it goes?

21 A. Yes, ma'am. For looking at the Air Force SG
22 side.

23 Q. Let me withdraw that and ask you a more
24 specific question.

25 So at the top of this organizational chart it

1 start out with the "Secretary of Defense." Do you see
2 that?

3 A. Yes, ma'am.

4 Q. And then there are a number of boxes
5 indicating a level immediately below the Secretary of
6 Defense, and one of those is "USD(P&R)." Do you see
7 that?

8 A. Yes, ma'am.

9 Q. What is that?

10 A. USD(P&R)," that's personnel and readiness.

11 Q. Okay. And what is the responsibility of
12 personnel and readiness?

13 A. To be honest, ma'am, that -- I don't fall
14 within that division. So I can't, you know, tell you
15 exactly what their responsibilities are.

16 Q. Okay. And so I take it that you fall under
17 the jurisdiction of the Secretary of the Air Force,
18 which is another one of those at that same level?

19 A. Yes, ma'am.

20 Q. Okay. And in that branch where the Secretary
21 of the Air Force is indicated, underneath there, there
22 is a box a couple of layers down for the "Air Force
23 SG." Do you see that?

24 A. Yes, ma'am.

25 Q. And that refers to the surgeon general?

1 A. Yes, ma'am.

2 Q. Okay. What is your relationship -- or where
3 do you fall into the different levels of authority
4 that are shown with respect to the Air Force --
5 yeah -- the Air Force structure in Exhibit 1 at the
6 top.

7 A. I fall into the civilian side that is
8 constructed very similar. It mirrors a lot of these
9 positions. So what you have here is a military org
10 chart of the side of the Air Force, and my side falls
11 more under the secretariat side. So my organizational
12 structure falls under the secretariat, the civilian
13 side.

14 Q. Okay. So if you were going to draw where you
15 fit on the organizational chart that's at the top of
16 Exhibit 1, would it have some reporting structure that
17 goes up to the Secretary of the Air Force?

18 A. Yes, ma'am.

19 Q. Okay. And what are the layers of reporting
20 between the secretary of the Air Force and you, if you
21 can figure that out, as you sit here now?

22 A. Sure. For the civilian side it would be the
23 secretary of the Air Force, and it would fall under to
24 several different directorates. So there's manpower
25 reserve affairs. I can -- there's manpower reserve

1 affairs. There's -- and I'd have to remember all the
2 direct names, but there's MRR, MRB, different
3 sub directorates.

4 And so I fall under MRR, which is reserve
5 affairs and airmen readiness. So there's four or five
6 different directorates under -- actually, SAF-MR --
7 and forgive me, I'm realizing that I don't
8 automatically know off the top of my head the whole
9 civilian side. But I know my side of it with the job
10 requirements.

11 So under SAF-MR, manpower and reserve
12 affairs, there's my division, which is SAF-MRR. I
13 don't know why we have all these acronyms, but there's
14 a couple of layers between myself and the secretary of
15 the Air Force.

16 Q. So it's the secretary of the Air Force and
17 then --

18 A. Staff MR, manpower reserve affairs, and then
19 under SAF-MR there would be my division, reserve
20 affairs and airmen readiness. There's a manpower
21 division. There's the review board agency. So
22 there's several other directorates, and we all funnel
23 up to SAF-MR, who reports directly to the secretary of
24 the Air Force.

25 Q. Okay. And who's the SAF-MR right now?

1 A. Right now it's Mr. Shon Manasco.

2 Q. And how recently did he start?

3 A. He started within this past month. Within
4 the first calendar year.

5 Q. And who was it before that?

6 A. The position has been vacant, and it's been
7 dual headed by the deputy, who is Mr. Dan Sitterly.

8 Q. Deputy what?

9 A. They call him the principal deputy of SAF-MR.
10 So he's a principal deputy. The position of SAF-MR is
11 a politically appointed position. So when the change
12 of administration -- the person who filled that which
13 was Mr. Gabe Camarillo.

14 Q. Was he replaced by someone else?

15 A. By Mr. Manasco. So with the change of
16 administration, the political appointees had to vacate
17 their positions in January. So it's taken the past
18 year to have that position filled.

19 Q. I see. So under the secretary of the Air
20 Force there was, for a long time, a vacant position
21 now filled by Shon Manasco?

22 A. Right. S-h-o-n.

23 Q. S-h-o-n. And the principal deputy to that
24 position is filled by Mr. Sitterly?

25 A. Correct.

1 Q. And has been since before the change in the
2 administration?

3 A. Yes, ma'am. Mr. Sitterly has been in that
4 position for -- he's been there since I started in
5 2014. So I don't know how long he's been in that
6 position, but he's been there for a number of years.

7 Q. And do you report to Mr. Sitterly directly?

8 A. No, ma'am. I report to my boss, Mr. John
9 Fedrigo.

10 Q. Okay. And does he report directly to
11 Mr. Sitterly?

12 A. Yes, ma'am.

13 Q. All right. Great. Let me see if I can ask
14 you a little bit going back to the organizational
15 chart. Underneath the personnel and readiness, there
16 is a box for "ASDHA." Do you see that?

17 A. Yes, ma'am.

18 Q. And does that refer to an assistant secretary
19 of defense for health affairs?

20 A. Yes, ma'am.

21 Q. Okay. And underneath that there's a box for
22 the "Defense Health Agency"; right?

23 A. Yes, ma'am.

24 Q. Okay. So in your position -- or the position
25 that you've held since 2014, do you end up interacting

1 with either the assistant Secretary of Defense for
2 health affairs or with the Defense Health Agency?

3 A. In my position I interact with both agencies,
4 yes, ma'am.

5 Q. Okay. And so can you explain a little bit
6 about what those two agencies do. Let's start with
7 health affairs.

8 A. Right. And the reason I hesitate right now,
9 due to the NDA 17, there's a massive rework of the
10 military health systems. So their jobs and roles are
11 changing right now. So what I tell you today may
12 change tomorrow.

13 Q. Okay. Understood. Can you explain what
14 NDA 17 is, please.

15 A. Sure. Yes, ma'am. That's the National
16 Defense Authorization Act of 2017.

17 Q. Okay. So understanding that what you're
18 saying is in flux, could you give me an understanding
19 of what goes on at Health Affairs, at least during
20 2017.

21 A. Yes, ma'am. So the Health Affairs Agency is
22 responsible for the development of -- development and
23 oversight of policy -- health policy for DoD. Also
24 referred to as OSD.

25 So they'll look at a plethora of different

1 health issues and write what they call DoD
2 instructions," DODIs to provide guidance to the
3 services on the implementation of the laws that are
4 enacted through the NDAA. So each year there's an
5 NDAA that's written, and there may be -- I think it's
6 Section 7 of the NDAA is the health policy section,
7 and it will address issues such as sexual assault,
8 TRICARE, operational requirements for the services.
9 So what Health Affairs will do is take that law and
10 make a policy out of it and establish it as a DODIs,
11 DoD instructions for which, once that's published, the
12 services will then incorporate their mechanisms to
13 carry out those policy requirements.

14 So Health Affairs is the policy oversight
15 that is the filter between the laws that are
16 established in the NDAA and then putting it out to
17 OSD.

18 Q. And can you translate "NDAA" for us, please.

19 A. I'm sorry. Yes. National Defense
20 Authorization Act.

21 Q. Okay. That's what I thought.

22 In general, the documents that we've seen are
23 thick with acronyms, and it would be helpful if, when
24 you run across an acronym, you either translate it
25 right on the spot or you're very patient when I ask

1 you to translate it later.

2 A. Yes, ma'am. I understand.

3 Q. Okay. Thank you.

4 So underneath Health Affairs with its policy
5 oversight function comes the Defense Health Agency.
6 Can you explain what the Defense Health Agency does
7 that is different from what Health Affairs does?

8 A. Yes, ma'am. The Defense Health Agency was
9 established following a requirement from the National
10 Defense Authorization Act for the services to
11 downsize, headquarter elements in all of the services
12 to downsize their personnel.

13 So Health Affairs, in their downsizing, moved
14 personnel to an organization which they established
15 called the "Defense Health Agency." So they downsized
16 their organization, Health Affairs, but created the
17 Defense Health Agency.

18 So the Defense Health Agency, in their
19 inception, was to focus on the mission-readiness
20 requirements for the services. So the Defense Health
21 Agency has been established as what they call a combat
22 support agency for the services.

23 They are required -- and the current change
24 that's happening right now from the most recent
25 National Defense Authorization Act 2017 was to create

1 a single organization that manages all the oversight
2 and management of the military treatment facilities.

3 Q. Those are the MTFs?

4 A. Yes, ma'am.

5 Q. All right.

6 A. So there has been a desire over many years
7 from Congress to reduce the redundancy and duplication
8 of the service efforts within their medical treatment
9 facilities to a single organization and have them all
10 pretty much act under one umbrella.

11 And so with the recent National Defense
12 Authorization Act of 2017, the Defense Health Agency
13 was identified as the sole source and provide
14 oversight over all the medical treatment facilities
15 for all the services. So right now their role is to
16 provide operational, administrative policy oversight
17 over the medical treatment facilities, which include
18 the CFO, the chief financial officer, the IT,
19 administration, patient safety, pretty much all the
20 management of what a medical treatment facility -- the
21 responsibilities that they would have. So...

22 Q. And in your job as assistant deputy for
23 health policy, how do you interact with the Defense
24 Health Agency?

25 A. We work together to look at their proposals.

1 As they're standing up their agency, they have --
2 their organizational structure has changed many times
3 as they figure out what their jobs are and how they're
4 going to be organized and how they're going to be
5 structured and look at the responsibilities that they
6 have and where they're going to go in order to take
7 over the medical treatment facilities.

8 So right now, my position is working with the
9 defense health agencies in looking at the Air Force
10 Surgeon General's directorates and the different
11 capabilities that we have right now to try and figure
12 out how we can best support the transition, but yet
13 minimize the impact to the operational and readiness
14 requirements of the Air Force.

15 Each service has a different construct of how
16 they do their business. You know, how they deploy.
17 The Army deploys much different than the Navy, than
18 deploys much different than the Air Force. So for the
19 Air Force, our medical capabilities have a reporting
20 requirement directly to the wing commander. So our
21 medical capabilities are specific to that wing
22 mission.

23 Whereas the Army, they have a medical
24 capability which takes care of the soldiers at their
25 local fort, post, you know, whatever they establish it

1 as, and then when they deploy, they go to a separate
2 location to deploy, to prepare for their deployment
3 and when they redeploy.

4 For the Air Force, our requirement is to be
5 able to be ready to be deployed in 72 hours. So which
6 means we have a higher medical requirement for our
7 wings than we do with the Army.

8 So trying to organize and have the Defense
9 Health Agency come in and do a generic reorganization
10 of the MTS so they are the same has had some growing
11 pains.

12 So my interface with the Defense Health
13 Agency is to make sure that the Air Force requirements
14 and constructs are recognized and have its minimal
15 impact on our ability to do our mission and also meet
16 the requirements of the Defense Health Agency.

17 Q. So let me ask you to go back up to Health
18 Affairs for a moment. In your position as assistant
19 deputy for health policy, how have you interacted with
20 Health Affairs?

21 A. My interaction with Health Affairs is more of
22 a representative to different working groups in
23 organizations and meetings.

24 Q. So you contribute to some of the ongoing
25 policy review by health affairs?

1 A. Yes, ma'am.

2 Q. Okay. So now let me turn back to the
3 Air Force. I think that you mentioned earlier that
4 the Air Force surgeon general is not on the civilian
5 side; is that correct?

6 A. This diagram that you have right here is more
7 of a military construct, correct.

8 Q. Okay. And so do you interact with the
9 Air Force surgeon general in your capacity as
10 assistant deputy for health policy?

11 A. Yes, ma'am.

12 Q. And what is the nature of your interaction
13 with the Air Force surgeon general?

14 A. My interaction with that office is -- on the
15 organizational chart would be a parallel kind of
16 cohort, if you would. So as the surgeon general works
17 with the Defense Health Agency or if the Defense
18 Health Agency tasks the service SGs, surgeon generals,
19 to do "X" and it has an impact on the mission or it's
20 a change in Air Force health policy, then the
21 Air Force surgeon general's office would work an
22 issue, provide a recommendation, and then that would
23 go back up through my office for review.

24 And then if it's a policy -- specific overall
25 policy issue, it will come through my office. I

review it, provide my recommendation for approval or
concur, and then we'd send it up through the
civilian side, through SAF-MR.

Q. Have you had interactions with the Air Force
surgeon general relating to -- actually, let me step
back for a moment before I start that question.

In 2016 Ash Carter announced a policy that
I'll call the "Open Service policy," if that's all
right with you.

A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. And you know the policy that I'm referring
to, I assume. Okay. Let me step back.

So you're aware that on June 30 of 2016
Secretary Carter announced a policy under which
transgender people would be able to serve openly in
the military; correct?

A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. Okay. And just for the sake of trying to
save a little time, I'm going to refer to that as the
"Open Service policy," if that's all right with you.

A. Yes, ma'am.

Q. Okay. Great.

So have you had any -- have you interacted on
a regular basis with the Air Force SG relating to that
policy?

1 A. Yes, ma'am.

2 Q. Okay. And what have been the nature of your
3 interactions with the Air Force SG on that subject?

4 A. We've had a lot of discussion on how to
5 implement this policy to ensure that we provide the
6 best healthcare for all of our service members with
7 the constraints of the current policy that's -- DoD
8 already has in place.

9 Q. And by the "current policy," which one are
10 you referring to?

11 A. The current policy that we have right now
12 that relates to healthcare is a DoDI, a D-O-D-I,
13 instruction, and the number is 6130.03, and it's the
14 medical accessions standards guide. That's what I
15 refer it to. I'd have to look up at the official
16 title of the policy, but it's...

17 Q. So I'm not sure that I fully understand what
18 you're saying, but are you saying that your primary
19 interactions with the Air Force SG have related to the
20 issue of accessions when it comes to the Open Service
21 policy?

22 A. Not only just accessions, but for our
23 currently serving service members.

24 Q. Okay. And so who at the Air Force SG's
25 office have you interacted with about those issues?

1 A. There have been several physicians that I
2 have worked with, and they also are members of the
3 medical accessions standards working group, as well as
4 looking at the current retention policies, the
5 healthcare issues. All healthcare-related policies.

6 So one of the primary physicians that I've
7 worked with is Dr. -- Lieutenant Colonel Dave
8 Miller --

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. -- and Colonel Dave Cunningham.

11 Q. They've been your primary points of contact
12 with the surgeon general's office on issues relating
13 to the Open Service policy?

14 A. Yes, ma'am.

15 Q. And what kinds of issues have you worked on
16 with them?

17 A. Again, they were discussions on -- with
18 Secretary Carter -- his first declaration was in July
19 of 2015 where he said, you know, the open service of
20 transgender members should be allowed and they should
21 be able to serve openly without any fear of reprisal,
22 discharge, you know, anything like that.

23 So following that announcement, OSD was
24 directed to start looking at policy, and we were given
25 180 days to develop policy to allow the open service

1 of transgender individuals.

2 Q. And you worked with -- I forgot the ranks
3 already that you told me with Miller and Cunningham.

4 A. Yes, ma'am.

5 Q. On that?

6 A. Yes, ma'am. So during that -- after the
7 announcement of July, in 2015, there was a working
8 group that was established in August of 2015 by the
9 USD P&R at the time where all the services were
10 brought together to take a look at the policy. "What
11 are we going to do? What does this mean?" And my
12 role specifically was looking at the healthcare. What
13 are the healthcare concerns. Are there any and what
14 can we do.

15 Q. So you were a member of that working group?

16 A. Indirectly.

17 Q. What do you mean by that?

18 A. So the working group was led by the USD P&R,
19 Mr. Brad Carson at the time, and the official invitees
20 were the representatives from SAF-MR, the surgeon
21 generals, and the personnel -- personnel divisions.
22 Because any time you want to do a change in policy,
23 personnel and medical are very intertwined.

24 So there was representatives from those three
25 major groups from all the services, and they were

1 allowed to bring what they called a "plus one." So I
2 was the plus one for SAF-MR as a health person.

3 Q. Okay. And the SAF-MR that you were the plus
4 one of was who?

5 A. Mr. Fedrigo was the primary attendee for that
6 working group.

7 Q. Okay. Let me ask you one more question about
8 what's shown in Exhibit 1. At the bottom of the page
9 you'll see that there is an almost identical
10 organizational chart that I think has the same problem
11 that the last one did, which is that it's the military
12 and not the civilian side.

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. But let me just ask you about one aspect of
15 it, which is that underneath the Assistant Secretary
16 of Defense for Health Affairs, there is listed a
17 further box for director of TRICARE management
18 activity. Do you see that?

19 A. Yes, ma'am.

20 Q. Okay. So what is TRICARE?

21 A. TRICARE is the civilian counterpart for
22 healthcare, if you will. It's -- the active duty
23 personnel receive healthcare through their medical
24 treatment facilities. TRICARE is the -- kind of what
25 we would refer to as OHI and other health insurance.