

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

D.T., a minor, by and through his parent and next friend Lizette Trujillo; Jane Doe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Susan Doe; and Helen Roe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Megan Roe,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Dr. Cara M. Christ, in her official capacity as State Registrar of Vital Records and Director of the State of Arizona’s Department of Health Services; Thomas Salow, in his official capacity as Branch Chief of the State of Arizona’s Division of Public Health Licensing Services at the Department of Health Services; and Krystal Colburn, in her official capacity as Bureau Chief and Assistant State Registrar of the State of Arizona’s Bureau of Vital Records,

Defendants.

Case No. 4:20-cv-00484-TUC-JAS

**JOINT STIPULATION FOR
ENTRY OF STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c), Plaintiffs D.T., Jane Doe, and Helen Roe, and Defendants Dr. Cara Christ, Thomas Salow, and Krystal Colburn (collectively, the “Parties”) file this Joint Stipulation for Entry of a Stipulated Protective Order.

1 1. Given the nature of this action, the Parties anticipate that some of the
2 information and materials exchanged in the course of discovery may contain Confidential
3 Material that contains sensitive personal or medical information for which special
4 protection is warranted.

5 2. The Parties have conferred regarding the form and substance of the Stipulated
6 Protective Order filed as Exhibit A to this Joint Stipulation and agree that the Court's entry
7 of the Stipulated Protective Order will appropriately protect the Parties' interests in their
8 respective Confidential Information and is appropriate to govern the use and disclosure of
9 such information in discovery and court proceedings.

10 3. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of responsive documents and information
11 during discovery, and to safeguard each party's right to prevent any improper use or
12 disclosure of confidential, proprietary, and/or otherwise privileged material, the Parties
13 respectfully request that the Court grant this Joint Stipulation and enter the attached
14 Stipulated Protective Order.

15 4. The Parties further agree to be bound by the terms of the Stipulated Protective
16 Order until the Court rules on this Joint Stipulation, and further agree that, if the Court
17 denies the Stipulated Protective Order, any discovery conducted before such time is bound
18 by the terms of the Stipulated Protective Order.

19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

STIPULATION

WHEREFORE, the Parties hereby stipulate and agree that the Court should enter the Stipulated Protective Order set forth in Exhibit A attached hereto.

IT IS SO STIPULATED.

Dated: November 13, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.

/s/Colin Proksel
Mary O’Grady (011434)
Colin Proksel (034133)
Payslie Bowman (035418)
OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.
2929 North Central Avenue, 21st Floor
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793
Telephone: (602) 640-9000
Facsimile: (602) 640-9050
Email: mogrady@omlaw.com
Email: cproksel@omlaw.com
Email: pbowman@omlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

The filer, Colin Proksel, attests that the other signatory listed, on whose behalf the filing is submitted, concurs in the filing’s content and has authorized the filing.

Dated: November 13, 2020

MARK BRNOVICH
Attorney General
Firm Bar No. 14000

/s/Patricia LaMagna (with permission)
Patricia Cracchiolo LaMagna (#021880)
Aubrey Joy Corcoran (#025423)
2005 N. Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004-1592
Telephone: (602) 542-8890
Facsimile: (602) 364-0700
E-mail: Patricia.Lamagna@azag.gov
AubreyJoy.Corcoran@azag.gov

Attorneys for Defendants

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on November 13, 2020, I electronically transmitted the attached documents to the Clerk’s Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to all CM/ECF registrants.

/s/ _____

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

D.T., a minor, by and through his parent and next friend Lizette Trujillo; Jane Doe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Susan Doe; and Helen Roe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Megan Roe,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Dr. Cara M. Christ, in her official capacity as State Registrar of Vital Records and Director of the State of Arizona's Department of Health Services; Thomas Salow, in his official capacity as Branch Chief of the State of Arizona's Division of Public Health Licensing Services at the Department of Health Services; and Krystal Colburn, in her official capacity as Bureau Chief and Assistant State Registrar of the State of Arizona's Bureau of Vital Records,

Defendants.

Case No. 4:20-cv-00484-TUC-JAS

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

1 a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Susan Doe; and Helen Roe, a minor, by
2 and through her parent and next friend Megan Roe; and Defendants Dr. Cara M. Christ, in
3 her official capacity as State Registrar of Vital Records and Director of the State of
4 Arizona’s Department of Health Services; Thomas Salow, in his official capacity as Branch
5 Chief of the State of Arizona’s Division of Public Health Licensing Services at the
6 Department of Health Services; and Krystal Colburn, in her official capacity as Bureau
7 Chief and Assistant State Registrar of the State of Arizona’s Bureau of Vital Records.

8 D. The term “Producing Party” will mean any person or entity named as a party
9 in this action or any non-party that produces or discloses any Materials in the course of this
10 litigation.

11 E. The term “Receiving Party” will mean any person or entity named as a party
12 in this action who receives any Materials produced or disclosed by a Producing Party in the
13 course of this litigation.

14 F. The term “Counsel” will mean counsel of record and other attorneys,
15 paralegals, secretaries, interns, externs, clerks, and other support staff employed by or
16 volunteering for counsel of record. Counsel of record in this action are:

17 PATRICK GUNN
18 pgunn@cooley.com
19 BARRETT J. ANDERSON
20 banderson@cooley.com
21 COOLEY LLP
22 101 California Street, 5th Floor
23 San Francisco, California 94111-5800

24 MARY O’GRADY
25 mogrady@omlaw.com
26 COLIN PROKSEL
27 cproksel@omlaw.com
28 PAYSLIE BOWMAN
pbowman@omlaw.com
OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.
2929 North Central Avenue, 21st Floor
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793

1 ASAF ORR
aorr@nclrights.org
2 NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN RIGHTS
870 Market Street, Suite 370
3 San Francisco, California 94102
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

4 AUBREY JOY CORCORAN
aubreyjoy.corcoran@azag.gov
5 PATRÍCIA C. LAMAGNA
Patricia.lamagna@azag.gov
6 ARIZONA ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE
2005 N. Central Avenue
7 Phoenix, AZ 85004

8 *Attorneys for Defendants*

9 As used in this Order, "Counsel" expressly includes Cooley LLP, Osborn Maledon, P.A.,
10 the National Center for Lesbian Rights, Attorney General Mark Brnovich, the Office of the
11 Attorney General, or any law firm appointed by the Office of the Attorney General to defend
12 this action.

13 The following provisions shall apply in this litigation:

14 1. Each Party or non-party to this litigation that produces or discloses any
15 Materials, answers to interrogatories, responses to requests for admission, trial testimony,
16 deposition testimony, and transcripts of trial testimony and depositions, or information that
17 the Producing Party believes should be subject to this Protective Order may designate the
18 same as "CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER."

19 a. Designation as "CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
20 ORDER": Any Producing Party may designate Materials as
21 "CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER" only if,
22 in the good faith belief of such Party and its Counsel, or of such non-
23 party, (1) the Materials contain personal, sensitive, confidential, or
24 proprietary information, the unrestricted disclosure of which could be
25 harmful to the operations, or other protectable interests of such Party
26 or non-party, or another party to whom a Producing Party reasonably
27 believes it owes an obligation of confidentiality with respect to such
28

1 Materials; or (2) the Materials must be kept confidential under Ariz.
2 Rev. Stat. §§ 36-322, 36-342, 36-344, under the Health Insurance
3 Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (“HIPAA”), or other
4 applicable law. If any Defendant produces Confidential Information
5 under the terms of this Order, then that Defendant shall be deemed to
6 have satisfied its confidentiality obligations under the foregoing
7 statutes, as applicable.

8 b. No designation of materials as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
9 PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall be made unless counsel for the
10 designating Party or non-party believes in good faith that such
11 information is “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
12 ORDER,” as defined in Subparagraph a. Counsel for the designating
13 Party or non-party shall make designations as narrowly and reasonably
14 as practicable, including but not limited to designating only certain
15 portions of documents as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
16 PROTECTIVE ORDER.” Confidential Information may include, but
17 is not limited to, any sensitive documents or information produced by
18 a Party or non-party, or any other information that constitutes
19 confidential information under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure
20 and/or applicable laws or regulations including U.S. federal, state, or
21 local privacy, data protection, or secrecy laws.

22 c. For illustrative purposes only, Confidential Information subject to
23 designation under Subparagraph a, above, may include: personnel
24 information, patient information, insurance or financial information,
25 business records, names or other identifying information tending to
26 reveal the identity of a Party, and any other highly sensitive
27 information that could jeopardize Plaintiffs’ privacy information, or
28 the privacy and security of the Defendants and/or the Arizona

1 Department of Health Services or the State of Arizona or any of its
2 agencies or political subdivisions.

3 d. A Producing Party may designate Materials containing Confidential
4 Information by affixing a legend or stamp on such Materials (except
5 deposition transcripts, discussed below in Paragraph 3, or native
6 materials, discussed below in Subparagraph e) as follows: The words
7 “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall be
8 placed clearly on each page of the document where practical or, where
9 not practical, prominently on at least the first page of such Materials.

10 e. For natively produced Materials containing Confidential Information,
11 the filename shall be the production number, the confidentiality
12 designation (“CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
13 ORDER”) shall be placed in the filename of each such natively
14 produced document, and the slip sheet corresponding to such Materials
15 shall include the production number and the confidentiality
16 designation. In the event the Receiving Party of such natively
17 produced Materials chooses to print or otherwise make a copy of such
18 Materials, the printout or copy must be marked with the confidentiality
19 designation.

20 f. The Parties agree that any Materials that are otherwise authentic for
21 purposes of admissibility remain authentic even if stamped
22 “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER”
23 pursuant to this Order.

24 2. In the event the Producing Party elects to produce Materials for inspection,
25 no marking need be made by the Producing Party in advance of the initial inspection. For
26 purposes of the initial inspection, all Materials produced will be considered as
27 “CONFIDENTIAL –SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER,” and must be treated as such
28 pursuant to the terms of this Order. Thereafter, upon selection of specified Materials for

1 copying by the Receiving Party, the Producing Party must, within a reasonable time prior
2 to producing those Materials to the Receiving Party, mark the copies of those Materials that
3 contain Confidential Information with the appropriate confidentiality marking.

4 3. Whenever a deposition taken on behalf of any Party involves the disclosure
5 of Confidential Information of any Party or non-party:

6 a. The deposition or portions of the deposition must be designated as
7 containing Confidential Information subject to the provisions of this
8 Order; such designation must be made on the record whenever
9 possible, but a Party or non-party may designate portions of
10 depositions as containing Confidential Information after transcription
11 of the proceedings; a Party or non-party will have until thirty (30) days
12 after receipt of the deposition transcript to inform the other Party or
13 Parties to the action of the portions of the transcript to be designated
14 “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER.”

15 b. The disclosing Party or non-party will have the right to exclude from
16 attendance at the deposition, during such time as the Confidential
17 Information is to be disclosed, any person other than the deponent,
18 Counsel (including their staff and associates), the court reporter, the
19 additional persons referenced in Paragraph 5 below, and the person(s)
20 agreed upon pursuant to Paragraph 8, below;

21 c. Any Materials containing Confidential Information that are used in the
22 taking of a deposition shall remain subject to the provisions of this
23 Order, along with the transcript pages of the deposition dealing with
24 such Materials. In such cases, the court reporter shall be informed of
25 this Order and shall be required to operate in a manner consistent with
26 this Order. In the event the deposition is videotaped, the original and
27 all copies of the videotape (or portions thereof) shall be marked by the
28 video technician to indicate that the contents of the videotape are

1 subject to this Order, substantially along the lines of “This videotape
2 may contain confidential testimony used in this case and is not to be
3 viewed or the contents thereof to be displayed or revealed except
4 pursuant to the terms of the operative Protective Order in this matter
5 or pursuant to written stipulation of the Parties”; and

- 6 d. The originals of the deposition transcripts and all copies of the
7 deposition must bear the legend “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
8 PROTECTIVE ORDER,” as appropriate, and the original or any copy
9 ultimately presented to a court for filing must not be filed unless it can
10 be accomplished under seal, identified as being subject to this Order,
11 and protected from being opened except by order of this Court.

12 4. Except as otherwise provided in this Order, all Confidential Information
13 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” must not be
14 disclosed by the Receiving Party to anyone other than those persons designated within this
15 Order and must be handled in the manner set forth below, and in any event, must not be
16 used for any purpose other than in connection with this litigation, unless and until such
17 designation is removed either by agreement of the Parties, or by order of the Court.

18 5. Information designated “CONFIDENTIAL –SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
19 ORDER” may be viewed only by:

- 20 a. Counsel (as defined in Paragraph F in the above Definitions) of the
21 Receiving Party;
22 b. Independent experts and stenographic and clerical employees
23 associated with such experts. Prior to receiving any Confidential
24 Information of the Producing Party, the expert must execute a copy of
25 the “Agreement to Be Bound by Stipulated Protective Order,” attached
26 hereto as Exhibit A. Counsel for the Receiving Party must retain
27 executed copies of such exhibits;
28 c. The Court and any court staff and administrative personnel;

- 1 d. Any court reporter employed in this litigation and acting in that
2 capacity;
- 3 e. Any person indicated on the face of the document to be its author or
4 co-author, or any person identified on the face of the document as one
5 to whom a copy of such document was sent before its production in
6 this action.
- 7 f. The named Parties and the personnel employed by them, including
8 Party principals or executives who are required to participate in policy
9 decisions with reference to this action, who have been advised of their
10 obligations hereunder, and who have signed an “Agreement to Be
11 Bound by Stipulated Protective Order,” attached hereto as Exhibit A;
- 12 g. Technical personnel of the Parties with whom Counsel for the Parties
13 find it necessary to consult, in the discretion of such Counsel, in
14 preparation for trial of this action;
- 15 h. Stenographic and clerical employees associated with the individuals
16 identified above; and
- 17 i. Any other person expressly agreed to, in writing, by the Parties; where,
18 however, such person will have access to materials designated as
19 “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” that
20 were produced by a non-party, the express written agreement of the
21 non-party must also be obtained.

22 6. At the time of delivery or disclosure, counsel of record for the Producing Party
23 shall instruct any person to whom any Confidential Information is delivered or disclosed to
24 maintain the confidentiality of all information protected by this Order and furnish to all such
25 persons a copy of this Order. Counsel of record shall maintain a record of all persons
26 outside of Counsel or the Parties (as defined above) to whom Confidential Information has
27 been disclosed or delivered. Counsel must also maintain original executed “Agreements to
28 Be Bound by Stipulated Protective Order.”

1 7. In addition to designating Materials as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
2 PROTECTIVE ORDER,” a Producing Party may require redactions to such Materials,
3 whether they are the Producing Party’s own materials or materials produced by another
4 Party or non-party for use in this litigation. To the extent that a Party objects to any such
5 redaction, the Parties shall address that dispute subject to the provisions of this Order set
6 forth below.

7 8. Before any Materials produced in discovery, answers to interrogatories,
8 responses to requests for admissions, deposition transcripts, or other documents which are
9 designated as Confidential Information are filed with the Court for any purpose, the Party
10 seeking to file such material must seek permission of the Court to file the material under
11 seal. Nothing in this Order shall be construed as automatically permitting a party to file
12 under seal. The Party seeking leave of Court shall show “compelling reasons” (where the
13 motion is more than tangentially related to the merits of the case) or “good cause” for filing
14 under seal. *See Ctr. For Auto Safety v. Chrysler Grp., LLC*, 809 F.3d 1092, 1101 (9th Cir.
15 2016). Additionally, such Party seeking to file under seal shall, within the applicable
16 deadline, file a redacted, unsealed version of any motion, response or reply if such Party is
17 waiting for a ruling from the Court on filing an unredacted, sealed version of the same
18 document.¹ Further, any proceeding before the Court, including, but not limited, to
19 conferences, hearings, or trial, whether held in open court or other means, shall be
20 conducted in a manner that keeps confidential the identities of the Plaintiffs permitted to
21 proceed under pseudonyms or otherwise reveal Confidential Information or Materials, or
22 information contained in those Materials, designated as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT
23 TO PROTECTIVE ORDER.” If a Party intends to use Confidential Information or
24 Materials during a proceeding before the Court, that Party must notify the other Party no

25 ¹ If a Party wishes to use the opposing Party’s confidential designations to support or oppose
26 a motion, the opposing Party bears the burden to make the “compelling reasons” or “good
27 cause” showing. In the event the Party wishing to use the Confidential Information
28 anticipates this scenario arising, the Party shall initiate a discovery dispute conference call
consistent with the terms of the Court’s Rule 16 Scheduling Order at least fourteen (14)
days before the due date of the filing in which the Party wishes to reference the information.

1 less than fourteen (14) days prior to the Court proceeding. That advance notice is required
2 so that the Party can determine the safeguards needed to protect the confidentiality of that
3 information or Materials and to meet and confer with other Party regarding a stipulation
4 that implements those safeguards. If the Parties are unable to agree upon the necessary
5 safeguards, the Party that designated that Confidential Information or Materials may seek
6 Court intervention. Failure to seek such safeguards from the other Party or the Court shall
7 not constitute an admission that the underlying information or materials are not confidential.

8 9. Except as otherwise provided in this Order, Confidential Information and
9 Materials designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall
10 be used solely for the prosecution or defense of this action. A Party who wishes to use
11 Confidential Information and/or Materials designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
12 PROTECTIVE ORDER” for a purpose other than the prosecution or defense of this action
13 must request permission, in writing, from Counsel for the Producing Party. The Receiving
14 Party’s request must identify the Confidential Information and/or Materials designated
15 “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” that the Receiving Party
16 wishes to use, and identify the purpose for which it wishes to use Confidential Information
17 and/or Materials designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER.”
18 If the parties cannot resolve the question of whether the Receiving Party can use
19 Confidential Information and/or Materials designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
20 PROTECTIVE ORDER” for a purpose other than the prosecution or defense of this action
21 within fourteen (14) days of the Producing Party’s receipt of such a request, the Receiving
22 Party may move the Court for a ruling on the Receiving Party’s request. In the event any
23 Party files a motion seeking to use Confidential Information and/or Materials designated
24 “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” for a purpose other than the
25 prosecution or defense of this action, the Confidential Information and/or Materials
26 designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall be
27 submitted to the Court, under seal, for an in-camera inspection. Any Confidential
28 Information and/or Materials designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO

1 PROTECTIVE ORDER” at issue must be treated as Confidential Information, as
2 designated by the Producing Party, until the Court has ruled on the motion or the matter has
3 been otherwise resolved.

4 10. At any stage of these proceedings, any Party may object to a designation of
5 Materials as Confidential Information. The Party objecting to confidentiality must notify,
6 in writing, counsel for the Producing Party, of the objected-to Materials and the grounds for
7 the objection. If the dispute is not resolved consensually between the parties within fourteen
8 (14) days of receipt of such a notice of objections, the objecting Party may move the Court
9 for a ruling on the objection. In the event any Party files a motion challenging the
10 designation or redaction of information, the document shall be submitted to the Court, under
11 seal, for an in-camera inspection. The Materials at issue must be treated as Confidential
12 Information, as designated by the Producing Party, until the Court has ruled on the objection
13 or the matter has been otherwise resolved. Nothing in the foregoing provisions shall be
14 construed to obligate a Party to challenge the propriety of a designation at the time made,
15 and a decision not to challenge a designation shall not preclude a subsequent challenge
16 thereto (nor shall it constitute any admission or inference that the information is, or ever
17 was, confidential).

18 11. At any stage of these proceedings, any Party may request that it be permitted
19 to disclose Materials designated as Confidential Information to individuals not permitted
20 by this Order to view such Materials. The Party must notify, in writing, counsel for the
21 Producing Party of the identity of the relevant Materials and the individuals to whom the
22 Party wishes to disclose the Materials. If the request is not resolved consensually between
23 the parties within fourteen (14) days of receipt of such a request, the requesting Party may
24 move the Court for a ruling allowing such disclosure. In the event any Party files a motion
25 requesting such disclosure, the document shall be submitted to the Court, under seal, for an
26 in-camera inspection. The Materials at issue must be treated as Confidential Information,
27 as designated by the Producing Party, until the Court has ruled on the request.

28

1 12. All Confidential Information must be held in confidence by those inspecting
2 or receiving it. To the extent the Confidential Information has not been disclosed prior to
3 and apart from this litigation, it must be used only for purposes of this action, except as
4 otherwise provided in this Order. If the Confidential Information was exchanged between
5 the Parties prior to and apart from this litigation for purposes of conducting their respective
6 businesses, the Parties may continue to use that otherwise Confidential Information for that
7 purpose. The Parties may not distribute the Confidential Information beyond those persons
8 or entities that had received the Confidential Information prior to this litigation. In addition,
9 Counsel for each Party, and each person receiving Confidential Information, must take
10 reasonable precautions to prevent the unauthorized or inadvertent disclosure of such
11 information. If Confidential Information is disclosed to any person other than a person
12 authorized by this Order, the Party responsible for the unauthorized disclosure must
13 immediately bring all pertinent facts relating to the unauthorized disclosure to the attention
14 of the other Parties and, without prejudice to any rights and remedies of the other Parties,
15 make every effort to prevent further disclosure by the party and by the person(s) receiving
16 the unauthorized disclosure.

17 13. No Party will be responsible to another Party or non-party for disclosure of
18 Confidential Information under this Order if the information in question is not labeled or
19 otherwise identified as such in accordance with this Order.

20 14. If a Party or non-party, through inadvertence, produces any Confidential
21 Information without labeling or marking or otherwise designating it as such in accordance
22 with this Order, the Producing Party may give written notice to the Receiving Party that the
23 Materials produced are deemed Confidential Information, and that the Materials produced
24 should be treated as such in accordance with that designation under this Order. The
25 Receiving Party must treat the Materials as confidential, once the Producing Party so
26 notifies the receiving Party. The inadvertent or unintentional failure to designate discovery
27 materials as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall not be
28 deemed a waiver in whole or in part of a Producing Party’s claim of confidential treatment

1 under this Order. If the Receiving Party has disclosed the Materials before receiving the
2 designation, the Receiving Party must notify the Producing Party in writing of each such
3 disclosure. Counsel for the Parties will agree on a mutually acceptable manner of labeling
4 or marking the inadvertently produced Materials as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
5 PROTECTIVE ORDER.”

6 15. This Order is entered to protect the confidentiality of information and
7 facilitating the exchange of documents and information between the Parties and producing
8 non-parties to this proceeding, without: (a) unreasonably or unnecessarily limiting or
9 restricting the ability of the Parties and/or Counsel to develop their claims or defenses in
10 this matter, (b) causing significant financial or personal harm or otherwise jeopardizing the
11 well-being of the Plaintiffs or their family members, such that the involvement of the Court
12 would not be unnecessarily required to resolve disputes over confidentiality, or
13 (c) preventing any Party from complying with the obligations imposed under applicable
14 public records, public information, and freedom of information acts. Nothing within this
15 Order will prejudice the right of any Party to object to the production of any discovery
16 material on the grounds that the material is protected as privileged or as attorney work
17 product. This Order shall not be construed to require production of documents, information,
18 or other material that a Party contends is protected from disclosure by the attorney-client
19 privilege, the work product protection, or other privilege, doctrine, or immunity. If
20 documents, information or other material subject to a claim of attorney-client privilege,
21 work product protection, or other privilege, doctrine, or immunity are inadvertently or
22 unintentionally produced, such production shall in no way prejudice or otherwise constitute
23 a waiver of, or estoppel as to, any such privilege, doctrine, or immunity. This Order shall
24 be interpreted to provide the maximum protection allowed by Federal Rule of Evidence
25 502(d). Any Producing Party that inadvertently or unintentionally produces documents,
26 information, or other material it reasonably believes is protected under the attorney-client
27 privilege, work product protection, or other privilege, doctrine, or immunity may obtain the
28 return of such documents, information or other material by promptly notifying the

1 Receiving Party and providing a privilege log for the inadvertently or unintentionally
2 produced documents, information or other material. The Receiving Party shall gather and
3 return all copies of such documents, information, or other material to the Producing Party
4 within five (5) business days, except for any pages containing privileged or otherwise
5 protected markings by the Receiving Party, which pages shall instead be destroyed and
6 certified as such to the Producing Party. Where it is reasonably apparent to a Receiving
7 Party that the documents or information was inadvertently sent or produced, and the
8 Receiving Party knows or reasonably should know that the documents or information is
9 privileged or subject to the work product protection, the Receiving Party shall: (a) refrain
10 from examining the documents or information any more than is necessary to determine that
11 they are privileged or subject to the work product protection, (b) promptly notify the
12 Producing Party, and (c) otherwise treat the information in compliance with Federal Rule
13 of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B).

14 16. Nothing in this Order will bar Counsel from rendering advice to their clients
15 with respect to this litigation and, in the course thereof, relying upon any information
16 designated as Confidential Information.

17 17. This Order will be without prejudice to the right of any Party to oppose
18 production of any information for lack of relevance or any other ground other than the mere
19 presence of Confidential Information. The existence of this Order must not be used by any
20 Party as a basis for discovery that is otherwise improper under the Federal Rules of Civil
21 Procedure.

22 18. Nothing herein shall (a) preclude the disclosure of Materials produced by any
23 Party or non-party to this litigation that is legally mandated under public records, public
24 information, and freedom of information acts, or (b) prevent any Party from discharging its
25 duties or obligations under any other applicable statute, rule, or regulation, subject to the
26 provisions set forth in Paragraph 22.

27 19. Information designated Confidential pursuant to this Order also may be
28 disclosed if: (a) the Party or non-party making the designation consents to such disclosure;

1 (b) the Court, after notice to all affected persons, allows such disclosure; or (c) the Party to
2 whom Confidential Information has been produced thereafter becomes obligated to disclose
3 the information in response to a lawful subpoena, public records request, or a court order
4 issued in other litigation.

5 20. If a Party is served with a public records request, subpoena, or court order as
6 described in Paragraph 19, then that Party (the “Served Party”) must give prompt notice to
7 counsel for the Producing Party that made the designation, regardless of whether the Served
8 Party intends to assert any defenses or exemptions from complying with the public records
9 request, subpoena, or court order. That notice must permit counsel for that Producing Party
10 sufficient time to intervene and seek judicial protection from the enforcement of this
11 subpoena, public records request, or court order, and/or seek the entry of an appropriate
12 protective order in the action in which the subpoena or court order was issued. Unless the
13 designating Party timely submits an objection seeking an order that the subpoena, public
14 records request, or court order need not be complied with, and serves such objection upon
15 the Served Party before the production date required by the subpoena, public records
16 request, or court order, the Served Party shall be permitted to produce documents responsive
17 to the subpoena, public records request, or court order on the response date. The designating
18 Party shall bear its own burden and expense of seeking protection of its Confidential
19 Information. Compliance by the Served Party with any order directing production pursuant
20 to the subpoena, public records request, or court order regarding any Material containing
21 Confidential Information shall not constitute a violation of this Order, provided that the
22 notice required by this Paragraph has been satisfied, and nothing in these provisions should
23 be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a
24 lawful directive from another court. In addition, and without limitation or waiver of any
25 other protection from public disclosure afforded by Arizona or federal law, all produced
26 Materials marked by the designating Party as “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
27 PROTECTIVE ORDER”—and for which such designation has not been determined to be
28 improper as a result of a challenge made under Paragraph 10—shall be presumptively

1 treated as exempt from disclosure pursuant to the Arizona Public Records Law, Ariz. Rev.
2 Stat. § 39-101 *et seq.*, and not subject to a document-level review by an entity in receipt of
3 a public records request.

4 21. Nothing in this Order shall limit any Producing Party's use of its own
5 documents or shall prevent any Producing Party from disclosing its own Confidential
6 Information to any person. Such disclosures shall not affect any confidential designation
7 made pursuant to the terms of this Order so long as the disclosure is made in a manner
8 which is reasonably calculated to maintain the confidentiality of the information. Nothing
9 in this Order shall prevent or otherwise restrict Counsel from rendering advice to their
10 clients, and in the course thereof, relying on examination of designated Confidential
11 Information.

12 22. The Parties agree that Materials produced by any Party or non-party to this
13 litigation may be disclosed, distributed, or otherwise provided by the Attorney General
14 Mark Brnovich, the chief law enforcement officer of the State of Arizona, by Dr. Cara
15 Christ, the Director of the Arizona Department of Health Services, who was sued in this
16 action in her official capacity, or by any successors to their positions, to any law
17 enforcement or regulatory agency or board, provided that the Attorney General or the
18 Director of the Arizona Department of Health Services believes in good faith that doing so
19 is necessary to discharge their duties as Attorney General or Director of the Arizona
20 Department of Health Services.

21 23. Except for Materials disclosed, distributed, or otherwise provided by the
22 Attorney General or the Director of the Arizona Department of Health Services under
23 Paragraph 22, or Materials being used in accordance with an agency's or board's applicable
24 statutes, rules, or regulations, within thirty (30) days of the final termination of this action,
25 including any and all appeals, Counsel for each Party must purge all Confidential
26 Information from all machine-readable media on which it resides and must either (a) return
27 all Confidential Information to the Party or non-party that produced the information,
28 including any copies, excerpts, and summaries of that information, or (b) destroy the same.

1 With respect to paper copies, return or destruction of Confidential Information is at the
2 option of the Producing Party. Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall be
3 interpreted or construed to require any officer, employee, or agency of the State of Arizona
4 to destroy any public records obtained in the ordinary course of such officer's or agency's
5 duties, or which must be maintained in compliance with state law, federal law, or the
6 regulations of such agency. Notwithstanding the foregoing, Counsel for each Party may
7 retain all pleadings, briefs, memoranda, motions, and other documents filed with the Court
8 that refer to or incorporate Confidential Information, and will continue to be bound by this
9 Order with respect to all such retained information, after the conclusion of this litigation.
10 Further, attorney work product Materials that contain Confidential Information need not be
11 destroyed, but, if they are not destroyed, the person in possession of the attorney work
12 product will continue to be bound by this Order with respect to all such retained information
13 after the conclusion of this litigation, except that Counsel may use work product from this
14 action in subsequent litigation, provided that Counsel does not use or disclose another
15 Party's Confidential Information.

16 24. The restrictions and obligations set forth within this Order will not apply to
17 any information that: (a) the Parties agree should not be designated Confidential
18 Information, including Materials previously designated Confidential Information that the
19 Parties subsequently agree in writing should not be designated under this Order; (b) the
20 Parties agree, or the Court rules, is already public knowledge; or (c) the Parties agree, or
21 the Court rules, has become public knowledge other than as a result of disclosure by the
22 receiving Party, its employees, or its agents, in violation of this Order.

23 25. Any Party or non-party may designate as "CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
24 PROTECTIVE ORDER" any Materials that were produced during the course of this action
25 without such designation before the effective date of this Order, as follows:

- 26 a. Parties or non-parties may designate such Materials by sending written
27 notice of such designation, accompanied by copies of the designated
28 Materials bearing the appropriate legend of "CONFIDENTIAL –

1 SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” to all other parties in
2 possession or custody of such previously undesignated Materials. Any
3 Party receiving such notice and copies of designated Materials
4 pursuant to this Subparagraph shall return to the producing Party all
5 undesignated copies of such Materials in its custody or possession, or
6 shall affix the appropriate legend to all copies of the designated
7 Materials in its custody or possession.

8 b. Upon notice of designation pursuant to this Paragraph, Parties shall
9 also: (i) make no disclosure of such designated Materials or
10 information contained therein except as allowed under this Order; and
11 (ii) take reasonable steps to notify any persons known to have
12 possession of such designated Materials or information of the effect of
13 such designation under this Order.

14 c. All such designations must be made within thirty (30) days of the date
15 of this Order.

16 d. To the extent any document produced before issuance of this Order
17 was designated “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
18 ORDER,” it shall receive the same treatment as if designated as such
19 under this Order, unless and until such document is re-designated to
20 have a different classification under this Order.

21 26. Transmission by e-mail or facsimile is acceptable for all notification purposes
22 within this Order.

23 27. This Order may be modified by agreement of the Parties, subject to approval
24 by the Court.

25 28. The Court may modify the terms and conditions of this Order for good cause,
26 or in the interest of justice, or on its own order at any time in these proceedings.

27 29. In the event additional parties join or are joined in this action, they shall not
28 have access to Confidential Information designated under this Order until the newly joined

1 party by its counsel has executed and filed with the Court its agreement to be bound by this
2 Order.

3 30. After termination of this action, the provisions of this Order shall continue to
4 be binding, except with respect to those documents and information that became a matter
5 of public record. This Court retains and shall have continuing jurisdiction over the parties
6 and recipients of Confidential Information and Materials designated as confidential for
7 enforcement of the provisions of this Order following termination of this litigation. Each
8 person or entity that receives or produces any Confidential Information designated under
9 this Order hereby agrees to subject itself to the jurisdiction of this Court for the purpose of
10 any proceedings related to the performance under, compliance with, or violation of this
11 Order.

12 31. Until such time as this Order has been entered by the Court, the Parties agree
13 that upon execution by all the Parties it will be treated as though it has been "So Ordered."
14

15
16 Dated: November 13, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.

/s/Colin Proksel

Mary O'Grady (011434)

Colin Proksel (034133)

Payslie Bowman (035418)

OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.

2929 North Central Avenue, 21st Floor

Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793

Telephone: (602) 640-9000

Facsimile: (602) 640-9050

Email: mogrady@omlaw.com

Email: cproksel@omlaw.com

Email: pbowman@omlaw.com

Asaf Orr (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN
RIGHTS

870 Market Street, Suite 370

San Francisco, California 94102

Telephone: (415) 392-6257

Facsimile: (415) 392-8442

Email: aorr@nclrights.org

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Patrick Gunn (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
COOLEY LLP
101 California Street, 5th Floor
San Francisco, California 94111-5800
Telephone: (415) 693-2070
Facsimile: (415) 693-2222
Email: pgunn@cooley.com

Barrett J. Anderson (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
COOLEY LLP
4401 Eastgate Mall
San Diego, California 92121-1909
Telephone: (858) 550-6000
Facsimile: (858) 550-6420
Email: banderson@cooley.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

MARK BRNOVICH
Attorney General
Firm Bar No. 14000

/s/Patricia Cracchiolo LaMagna
Patricia Cracchiolo LaMagna (#021880)
Aubrey Joy Corcoran (#025423)
2005 N. Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004-1592
Telephone: (602) 542-8890
Facsimile: (602) 364-0700
E-mail: Patricia.Lamagna@azag.gov
AubreyJoy.Corcoran@azag.gov

Attorneys for Defendants

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

D.T., a minor, by and through his parent and next friend Lizette Trujillo; Jane Doe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Susan Doe; and Helen Roe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Megan Roe,

Plaintiffs,
v.

Case No. 4:20-cv-00484-TUC-JAS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENT AND
AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND BY THE
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Dr. Cara M. Christ, in her official capacity as State Registrar of Vital Records and Director of the State of Arizona’s Department of Health Services; Thomas Salow, in his official capacity as Branch Chief of the State of Arizona’s Division of Public Health Licensing Services at the Department of Health Services; and Krystal Colburn, in her official capacity as Bureau Chief and Assistant State Registrar of the State of Arizona’s Bureau of Vital Records,

I, _____, declare and state that:

1. I am employed as _____

by _____.

2. I have read the Stipulated Protective Order (the “Order”) entered in the

1 above-captioned case and have received a copy of the Order.

2 3. I promise that I will use any and all “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO
3 PROTECTIVE ORDER” information, as defined in the Order, given to me only in a
4 manner authorized by the Order, and only to assist Counsel in the litigation of this matter.

5 4. I promise that I will not disclose or discuss such “CONFIDENTIAL –
6 SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” information with anyone other than the persons
7 described in Paragraph 5.

8 5. I acknowledged that, by signing this agreement, I am subjecting myself to
9 the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the District of Arizona with respect
10 to the enforcement of the Order.

11 6. I understand that any disclosure or use of “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT
12 TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” information in any manner contrary to the provisions of the
13 Order may subject me to sanctions for contempt of court.

14 7. I will return all “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
15 ORDER” Materials (as defined in the Order) to the attorney who provided them to me,
16 upon request by that attorney, and I shall not retain any copies of said Materials or any
17 information contained within “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
18 ORDER” Materials.

19
20 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

21
22 Executed on _____.

23
24 _____
25 Signature
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

D.T., a minor, by and through his parent and next friend Lizette Trujillo; Jane Doe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Susan Doe; and Helen Roe, a minor, by and through her parent and next friend Megan Roe,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Dr. Cara M. Christ, in her official capacity as State Registrar of Vital Records and Director of the State of Arizona’s Department of Health Services; Thomas Salow, in his official capacity as Branch Chief of the State of Arizona’s Division of Public Health Licensing Services at the Department of Health Services; and Krystal Colburn, in her official capacity as Bureau Chief and Assistant State Registrar of the State of Arizona’s Bureau of Vital Records,

Defendants.

Case No. 4:20-cv-00484-TUC-JAS

[PROPOSED] ORDER
ADOPTING STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER

Having reviewed the Joint Stipulation for a Protective Order, the Parties have shown there is good cause for entering such an order in this matter. The Protective Order submitted to this Court shall be entered as an order of this Court.

IT IS SO ORDERED.