

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
ALEXANDRIA DIVISION**

RICHARD ROE, VICTOR VOE and  
OUTSERVE-SLDN, INC.,

*Plaintiffs,*

v.

RICHARD V. SPENCER, in his official capacity  
as acting Secretary of Defense; MATTHEW  
DONOVAN, in his official capacity as the Acting  
Secretary of the Air Force; and the UNITED  
STATES DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE,

*Defendants.*

NO. 1:18-CV-01565-LMB-IDD

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO SEAL  
THEIR MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THEIR MOTION FOR PARTIAL  
SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND EXHIBITS A–C & F–J TO THAT MEMORANDUM**

Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 5, Plaintiffs move to seal their Memorandum in Support of their Motion for Partial Summary Judgment and Exhibits A–C & F–J to that Memorandum. In support of this motion to seal, Plaintiffs state as follows:

1. Exhibit A is a memorandum written by the Secretary of the Air Force Personnel Center regarding whether to retain or discharge Victor Voe. This document contains personal identifying information of Plaintiff Voe.

2. Exhibit B is the findings and recommended disposition of the SAFPC on Victor Voe's appeal. This document contains personal identifying information of Victor Voe.

3. Exhibit C is an email discussing the disposition of Plaintiff Voe's case. This document contains personal identifying information of Plaintiff Voe.

4. Exhibit F is an email between Air Force officials. This document has been marked confidential by Defendants, and is therefore subject to the protective order in this case.

5. Exhibit G is an email between Air Force officials. This document has been marked confidential by Defendants, and is therefore subject to the protective order in this case.

6. Exhibit H is an email between Air Force officials. This document has been marked confidential by Defendants, and is therefore subject to the protective order in this case.

7. Exhibit I is an email between Air Force officials. This document has been marked confidential by Defendants, and is therefore subject to the protective order in this case.

8. Exhibit J is an information memorandum for the Secretary of Defense. This document has been marked confidential by Defendants, and is therefore subject to the protective order in this case.

9. Plaintiffs' Memorandum in Support of Their Motion for Partial Summary Judgment quotes the content of these documents.

10. With this Memorandum in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion to File Under Seal, Plaintiffs have also filed a Notice of Motion to File Under Seal, Motion to File Under Seal, and a Proposed Order to seal the materials, pursuant to Local Rule 5.

11. Under established Fourth Circuit precedent, there are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice of the request to seal with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings supporting a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to seal. *Ashcraft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000). Plaintiffs have complied with these requirements.

12. First, as mentioned above, Plaintiffs have filed along with this Motion a Notice of Motion to File Under Seal. Should Defendants or any interested member of the public object to the motion, they may raise their objections with the Court.

13. Second, there are no less drastic alternatives to sealing. Plaintiffs will publicly file redacted versions of these documents so that the public may have the greatest access possible, while still protecting confidential information.

14. Third, a decision to seal these documents would be supported by Fourth Circuit precedent. The Court has already determined in this case, and in the companion case *Harrison, et al. v. Esper, et al.*, No. 18-cv-641, that documents marked as confidential by the Air Force are subject to the Court's protective order in this case. *See Harrison*, ECF No. 128, 175–76; *Roe*, ECF No. 158. The protective order provides that “Protected Material . . . shall not be filed on the public record,” and “[t]o the extent that Protected Material is relied upon by the Parties in briefs, it should be redacted.” The Court has further already stated that the personal identifying information of Plaintiffs and others living with HIV should be redacted from the public record. *See, e.g.*, Order Granting Mot. to Seal, ECF No. 136. These documents are marked as confidential or contain the personal identifying information of Plaintiffs. Their contents must therefore be redacted prior to being placed on the public record. Plaintiffs seek to file unredacted versions under seal for the benefit of the Court and Defendants.

Accordingly, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court enter an order sealing the unredacted version of their Memorandum in Support of Their Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, and Exhibits A–C and F–J to that memorandum, and allowing Plaintiffs to publicly file redacted versions by August 2, 2019.

Dated: July 23, 2019

/s/ Scott Schoettes

Scott Schoettes\*  
SSchoettes@lambdalegal.org  
Kara Ingelhart\*  
KIngelhart@lambdalegal.org  
LAMBDA LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
EDUCATION FUND, INC.  
105 W. Adams St., Suite 2600  
Chicago, IL 60603  
T: (312) 663-4413

Anthony Pinggera\*  
APinggera@lambdalegal.org  
LAMBDA LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
EDUCATION FUND, INC.  
4221 Wiltshire Blvd., Suite 280  
Los Angeles, CA 90010  
T: (213) 382-7600

Peter E. Perkowski\*  
PeterP@outserve.org  
OUTSERVE-SLDN, INC.  
P.O. Box 65301  
Washington, DC 20035-5301  
T: (800) 538-7418

*\*pro hac vice*

/s/ John W. H. Harding

John W.H. Harding  
Virginia State Bar No. 87602  
JWHarding@winston.com  
Lauren Gailey\*  
LGailey@winston.com  
Laura Cooley  
Virginia State Bar No. 93446  
LCooley@winston.com  
Alexandra J. Hemmings\*  
AHemmings@winston.com  
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP  
1700 K St., NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
T: (202) 282-5000

Julie A. Bauer\*  
JBauer@winston.com  
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP  
35 W. Wacker Dr.  
Chicago, IL 60601  
T: (312) 558-560

Andrew R. Sommer  
Virginia State Bar No. 70304  
Sommera@gtlaw.com  
GREENBERG TRAUIG, LLP  
1750 Tysons Boulevard  
Suite 1000  
McLean, VA 22102  
T: (703) 749-1370

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that, on the 23rd day of July, 2019, I caused this document to be filed electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system, which automatically sent a notice of electronic filing to all counsel of record.

Dated: July 23, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ John W. H. Harding  
John W.H. Harding