

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN**

CODY FLACK, *et al.*,
individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WISCONSIN DEPARTMENT OF
HEALTH SERVICES, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:18-cv-00309-wmc
Judge William Conley

**REPLY BRIEF IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO STRIKE
EXPERT DECLARATION AND EXCLUDE TESTIMONY
OF MICHELLE OSTRANDER, Ph.D.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
INTRODUCTION.....	1
ARGUMENT.....	3
I. BECAUSE DR. OSTRANDER DID NOT FORM HER OWN OPINIONS OR STATE ANY OPINIONS IN HER DECLARATION, SHE HAS FAILED TO COMPLY WITH RULE 26, RULE 702, AND <i>DAUBERT</i>.....	3
II. DR. OSTRANDER’S PURPORTED OPINION ON THE OVERALL QUALITY OF THE RESEARCH EVIDENCE ON SURGICAL TREATMENTS FOR GENDER DYSPHORIA IS IRRELEVANT TO ANY FACTUAL DISPUTE.	9
A. Defendants Are Improperly Attempting to Use Dr. Ostrander’s Testimony and the Hayes Reports Attached to Her Declaration to Generate “Disputes” on Topics for Which She Is Not Offering an Opinion.	11
1. <u>Overall Quality of the Evidence</u>	14
2. <u>Efficacy in Treating Gender Dysphoria</u>	15
3. <u>Safety</u>	16
4. <u>Medical Necessity</u>	16
III. EVEN IF DR. OSTRANDER’S PURPORTED OPINIONS WERE MATERIAL, PLAINTIFFS HAVE IDENTIFIED SIGNIFICANT RELIABILITY ISSUES WARRANTING EXCLUSION OF THOSE OPINIONS.....	17
A. Federal Courts Have Uniformly Found Hayes Reports, on Their Own, to be an Insufficient Basis for Categorically Excluding Coverage for Medical Procedures.	18
B. There Is No Indication That the Proprietary Hayes Letter-Grade Rating is Generally Accepted in the Field or Otherwise Replicable.	19
C. Hayes’ Subjective Decisions About What Outcomes to Measure and What Studies to Review Raise Questions About the Overall Reliability of Their Conclusions.....	20
D. The 2018 Annual Review on Ancillary Services Followed No Scientific Methodology.....	22
CONCLUSION	23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	Page(s)
<i>American Key Corp. v. Cole National Corp.</i> , 762 F.2d 1569 (11th Cir. 1985).....	7
<i>Boyer v. Weyerhaeuser Co.</i> , No. 14-cv-286-wmc, 2016 WL 705233 (W.D. Wis. Feb. 19, 2016).....	11
<i>Brown v. Burlington N. Santa Fe Ry. Co.</i> , 765 F.3d 765 (7th Cir. 2014).....	21
<i>Cates v. Whirlpool Corp.</i> , No. 15-cv-5980, 2017 WL 1862640 (N.D. Ill. May 9, 2017)	11
<i>Corporate Finance, Inc. v. Principal Life Insurance Co.</i> , No. 05-20595-CIV, 2006 WL 3365600 (S.D. Fla. Nov. 20, 2006).....	7
<i>Dura Auto. Sys. of Ind. v. CTS Corp.</i> , 285 F.3d 609 (7th Cir. 2002).....	5–6
<i>Ervin v. Johnson & Johnson, Inc.</i> , 492 F.3d 901 (7th Cir. 2007).....	11
<i>Gopalratnam v. Hewlett-Packard Co.</i> , 877 F.3d 771 (7th Cir. 2017)	5–6
<i>Ingram v. Novartis Pharm. Corp.</i> , 282 F.R.D. 563 (W.D. Okla. 2012)	8
<i>Kumho Tire Co. v. Carmichael</i> , 526 U.S. 137 (1999)	21
<i>Pecher v. Owens-Illinois, Inc.</i> , 859 F.3d 396 (7th Cir. 2017).....	11
<i>Rivera v. Heck</i> , No. 16-cv-673-wmc, 2018 WL 4354949 (W.D. Wis. Sept. 12, 2018)	11
<i>Tokio Marine & Fire Ins. Co. v. Norfolk & Western Ry. Co.</i> , 172 F.3d 44, 1999 WL 12931 (4th Cir. 1999)	5
 Rules	 Page(s)
Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(B)(i).....	4
Fed. R. Evid. 702	9, 11, 22

REDACTED

The text of this brief (pages 1 to 23), which refers throughout to information marked confidential by Defendants, is redacted pursuant to the Protective Order in this case.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Dated: July 3, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph J. Wardenski

Joseph J. Wardenski

Jennifer I. Klar

Alexa T. Milton

Orly T. May

RELMAN, DANE & COLFAX PLLC

1223 19th Street, NW, Suite 600

Washington, DC 20036

Telephone: (202) 728-1888

Facsimile: (202) 728-0848

jwardenski@relmanlaw.com

jklar@relmanlaw.com

amilton@relmanlaw.com

omay@relmanlaw.com

Robert Theine Pledl

DAVIS & PLEDL, S.C.

1433 N. Water Street, Suite 400

Milwaukee, WI 53202

(414) 488-1354

rockpled@gmail.com

Abigail Coursolle

Catherine McKee

NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM

200 N. Greensboro Street, Suite D-13

Carrboro, NC 27510

Telephone: (919) 968-6308

Facsimile: (919) 968-8855

coursolle@healthlaw.org

mckee@healthlaw.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs