

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN**

CODY FLACK, *et al.*,
individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WISCONSIN DEPARTMENT OF
HEALTH SERVICES, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:18-cv-00309-wmc
Judge William Conley

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO STRIKE
EXPERT DECLARATION AND EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF
MICHELLE OSTRANDER, Ph.D.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
INTRODUCTION.....	1
RELEVANT BACKGROUND	3
A. Michelle Ostrander, PhD.....	3
B. Hayes Reports.....	5
C. Hayes Reports Attached to Ostrander Declaration	6
1. <u>2014 HTA on Sex Reassignment Surgery</u>	<u>7</u>
2. <u>2014 HTA on Ancillary Services.....</u>	<u>8</u>
3. <u>2018 Annual Review on Ancillary Services</u>	<u>8</u>
4. <u>2018 HTA on Sex Reassignment Surgery</u>	<u>8</u>
D. Dr. Ostrander’s Opinions (or Admitted Lack Thereof).....	10
ARGUMENT.....	12
I. DR. OSTRANDER’S REPORT FAILS TO MEET THE BASIC EXPERT DISCLOSURE REQUIREMENTS OF RULE 26(A)(2)(B) AND SHOULD BE EXCLUDED.....	12
A. Dr. Ostrander’s Declaration Fails to Include Any Statement of Her Opinions.....	13
B. Attaching Reports Written by Others and Adopting Their Conclusions as Her Own Does Not Satisfy Rule 26.....	15
C. This Court Should Strike Dr. Ostrander’s Report and Testimony Under Rule 37 for Failing to Meet Rule 26’s Basic Disclosure Requirements.....	16
II. DR. OSTRANDER IS NOT QUALIFIED TO OPINE ON ANY RELEVANT ISSUES IN THE CASE AND HER TESTIMONY IS INADMISSIBLE UNDER RULE 702 AND DAUBERT.....	17
1. <u>Dr. Ostrander is Not Qualified to Provide an Opinion on the Medical Necessity, Safety, or Efficacy of Treatments for Gender Dysphoria.</u>	<u>18</u>

2.	<u>Dr. Ostrander’s Reasoning and Methodology Are Not Reliable.</u>	19
3.	<u>Dr. Ostrander’s Opinion on the Quality of the Evidence Would Not Assist the Court or a Jury in Resolving Any Factual Dispute.</u>	26
III.	THE HAYES REPORTS ATTACHED AS EXHIBITS TO DR. OSTRANDER’S RULE 26 REPORT ARE INADMISSIBLE HEARSAY.	27
	CONCLUSION	30

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	Page(s)
<i>Am. Key Corp. v. Cole Nat'l Corp.</i> , 762 F.2d 1569 (11th Cir. 1985).....	20, 21, 26
<i>Baker v. Chevron USA, Inc.</i> , 680 F. Supp. 2d 865 (S.D. Ohio 2010).....	15
<i>Berge v. United States</i> , 879 F. Supp. 2d 98 (D.D.C. 2012)	22, 23
<i>Ciomber v. Coop. Plus, Inc.</i> , 527 F.3d 635 (7th Cir. 2008).....	13, 16, 17
<i>Cooke v. Town of Colo. City</i> , No. CV 10-08105, 2013 WL 551508 (D. Ariz. Feb. 13, 2013).....	13, 14
<i>Corp. Fin., Inc. v. Principal Life Ins. Co.</i> , No. 05-20595-CIV, 2006 WL 3365600 (S.D. Fla. Nov. 30, 2006).....	20
<i>Cruz v. Zucker</i> , 195 F. Supp. 3d 554 (S.D.N.Y. 2016).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.</i> , 509 U.S. 579 (1993).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Dukes v. Illinois Cent. R. Co.</i> , 934 F. Supp. 939 (N.D. Ill. 1996)).....	3
<i>Ervin v. Johnson & Johnson, Inc.</i> , 492 F.3d 901 (7th Cir. 2007).....	17, 18, 19
<i>Finchum v. Ford Motor Co.</i> , 57 F.3d 526 (7th Cir. 1995).....	27
<i>Gong v. Hirsch</i> , 913 F.2d 1269 (7th Cir. 1990).....	27
<i>In re James Wilson Assocs.</i> , 965 F.2d 160 (7th Cir. 1992).....	27, 28
<i>Ingram v. Novartis Pharm. Corp.</i> , 282 F.R.D. 563 (W.D. Okla. 2012)	15
<i>James T. Scatuorchio Racing Stable, LLC v. Walmac Stud Mgmt., LLC</i> , No. CIV.A. 5:11-374-DCR, 2014 WL 1744848 (E.D. Ky. Apr. 30, 2014).....	20
<i>K.G. ex rel. Garrido v. Dudek</i> , 981 F. Supp. 2d 1275 (S.D. Fla. 2013)	22, 23
<i>Kumho Tire Co. v. Carmichael</i> , 526 U.S. 137 (1999)	19
<i>Lapsley v. Xtek, Inc.</i> , 689 F.3d 802 (7th Cir. 2012).....	19, 20
<i>Lyons v. Leatt Corp.</i> , 322 F.R.D. 327 (N.D. Ind. 2017)	13, 16
<i>Merit Motors, Inc. v. Chrysler Corp.</i> , 569 F.2d 666 (D.C. Cir. 1977)	26

<i>Mid-State Fertilizer Co. v. Exchange Nat'l Bank of Chicago</i> , 877 F.2d 1333 (7th Cir. 1989)	3
<i>Ninth Ave. Remedial Grp. v. Allis-Chalmers Corp.</i> , 141 F. Supp. 2d 957 (N.D. Ind. 2001).....	27, 28
<i>Novak v. Bd. of Trustees of S. Illinois Univ.</i> , 777 F.3d 966 (7th Cir. 2015)	13, 16
<i>Ohime v. Foresman</i> , 186 F.R.D. 507 (N.D. Ind. 1999)	14
<i>Olson v. Morgan</i> , 750 F.3d 708 (7th Cir. 2014)	28
<i>Potter v. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Mich.</i> , No. 10-cv-14981, 2013 WL 4413310 (E.D. Mich. Mar. 30, 2013).....	22, 23
<i>Reese v. Herbert</i> , 527 F.3d 1253 (11th Cir. 2008).....	13
<i>Rivera v. Heck</i> , No. 16-cv-673-wmc, 2018 WL 4354949 (W.D. Wis. Sept. 12, 2018).....	17
<i>Salgado by Salgado v. Gen. Motors Corp.</i> , 150 F.3d 735 (7th Cir. 1998)	12, 13, 16
<i>Smith v. State Farm Fire & Cas. Co.</i> , 164 F.R.D. 49 (S.D.W. Va. 1995).....	15
<i>Stasior v. Nat'l R.R. Passenger Corp.</i> , 19 F. Supp. 2d 835 (N.D. Ill. 1998)	3
<i>Stein v. Foamex Int'l, Inc.</i> , No. CIV. A. 00-2356, 2001 WL 936566 (E.D. Pa. Aug. 15, 2001).....	13
<i>United States v. Grey Bear</i> , 883 F.2d 1382 (8th Cir. 1989)	27
<i>United States v. Johnsted</i> , 30 F. Supp. 3d 814 (W.D. Wis. 2013).....	19
<i>Whitley v. Carolina Care Plan, Inc.</i> , No. C/A 3:06-257-CMC, 2006 WL 3827503 (D.S.C. Dec. 28, 2006)	22, 23, 24

Rules	Page(s)
Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 Advisory Committee note	12
Fed. R. Civ. P. 37(c)(1).....	13, 16
Fed. R. Evid. 702	<i>passim</i>

Other Authorities	Page(s)
6 James Wm. Moore et al., Moore's Federal Practice ¶ 26.23[4] (3d ed. 2000)	13

REDACTED

The text of this brief (pages 1 to 30), which refers throughout to information marked confidential by Defendants, is redacted pursuant to the Protective Order in this case.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Dated: June 4, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph J. Wardenski

Joseph J. Wardenski

Jennifer I. Klar

Orly T. May

Alexa T. Milton

RELMAN, DANE & COLFAX PLLC

1223 19th Street, NW, Suite 600

Washington, DC 20036

Telephone: (202) 728-1888

Facsimile: (202) 728-0848

jwardenski@relmanlaw.com

jklar@relmanlaw.com

omay@relmanlaw.com

amilton@relmanlaw.com

Robert Theine Pledl

DAVIS & PLEDL, S.C.

1433 N. Water Street, Suite 400

Milwaukee, WI 53202

(414) 488-1354

rockpled@gmail.com

Abigail Coursolle

Catherine McKee

NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM

200 N. Greensboro Street, Suite D-13

Carrboro, NC 27510

Telephone: (919) 968-6308

Facsimile: (919) 968-8855

coursolle@healthlaw.org

mckee@healthlaw.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs