

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

Joint Set of Exhibits
Relating to Plaintiffs' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment

Table of Contents

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos.¹ |
|----------------------------|--|--|
| A (ECF No. 83-4) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of the Deposition of Paul Peek</i> , Defendant the United States Department of State's designee under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 30(b)(6) | 70, 75, 79-85, 97, 105, 107-121, 123- 149, 151, 172 |
| B (ECF No. 83-5) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of the Deposition of Frances Terri Day</i> | 55, 57-63, 65, 68, 77, 78, 86, 90, 119 |
| C (ECF No. 83-6) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of the Deposition of Andrew Dvash-Banks</i> | 1-8, 10-16, 20, 30-32, 39, 40, 44, 45, 47, 48, 50-53, 55, 56, 63 |

¹ Plaintiffs' cited Combined Statement of Fact Numbers contained herein track the same numbers used in Plaintiffs' Statement of Undisputed Facts (ECF 83-24). Defendants' Statement of Genuine Disputes (ECF 101-1) altered this numbering for Fact Nos. 89-130. Defendants did so by deleting Plaintiffs' Fact No. 89. Because Fact 89 was deleted by Defendants, the subsequent numbering in Defendants' Statement of Genuine Disputes is one number lower than Plaintiffs' numbering until Fact No. 130. Defendants' Statement of Genuine Disputes repeats Fact No. 130 twice, entered as both 130 and 131. Because of the repetition, all facts after No. 131 in Defendants' Statement of Genuine Disputes resume the correct numbering that properly tracks Plaintiffs' original filing. Plaintiffs have corrected Defendants' improper alterations in the Combined Statement of Facts and citations herein track those corrected numbers.

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos.¹ |
|---------------------------------------|---|---|
| D (ECF No. 83-7) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of the Deposition of Margaret Ramsay</i> | 61, 63, 66, 67, 69-73, 76, 79, 80, 83, 88, 89, 98, 107, 108, 119, 122, 127 |
| E (ECF No. 83-8) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of the Deposition of Larilyn Reffett</i> | 54, 66, 67, 72, 73, 75, 77, 90, 92, 94-96, 99, 110, 118, 119, 121, 127 |
| F (ECF No. 83-9) | Excerpts of <i>Plaintiffs' Responses to Defendants' First Set of Discovery Responses</i> | 46, 49, 100-106 |
| G (ECF No. 107-2; 107-3) | Excerpts of the <i>Administrative Record</i> | 56, 154 |
| G-1 (ECF No. 83-12) | Application for a Consular Report of Birth Abroad of a Citizen of the United States of America, without exhibits, submitted on behalf of plaintiff E.J. D.-B. | 9 |
| G-2 (ECF No. 83-13) | Application for a U.S. Passport, without exhibits, submitted on behalf of E.J. D.-B. | |
| G-3 (ECF No. 83-14) | Marriage License for Andrew Dvash-Banks and Elad Dvash-Banks | 11, 59 |
| G-4 (ECF No. 83-15) | Surrogacy Agreement between Andrew Dvash-Banks, Elad Dvash-Banks and the surrogate who carried E.J. D.-B. and his twin brother, A.J. D.-B. | 17-19, 21-28, 37-40, 64, 152-154, 158-161 |

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos.¹ |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| G-5 (ECF No. 83-16) | Statement of Live Birth of E.J. D.-B. from the Ontario Office of the Registrar General | 29, 31, 33-35, 37, 60, 61 |
| G-6 (ECF No. 83-17) | Ontario Superior Court of Justice Order dated September 28, 2016 | 37, 39-43, 45, 62 |
| G-7 (ECF No. 83-18) | Letter from Viaguard Accu-Metrics dated January 30, 2017 | 47-49, 87, 88 |
| G-8 (ECF No. 83-19) | Letter from Frances Terri Day to Andrew Dvash-Banks dated March 2, 2017 | 92, 93 |
| G-9 (ECF No. 107-4) | “ACS Activity Log” at the United States Consulate in Toronto, Canada relating to the January 24, 2017 interview of the Dvash-Banks family, as that log appeared in the State Department’s records on November 2, 2018 | 69 |
| G-10 (ECF No. 107-5) | Email from Margaret Ramsay to Frances Terri Day dated January 24, 2017 | 67 |
| Pliffs’ H (ECF No. 83-21) | Consular Report of Birth Abroad received on or about March 2, 2017 from the United States Consulate in Toronto for A.J. D.-B., produced as DVASH-BANKS00000017 | 90, 91, 115 |

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos. ¹ |
|--------------------------------|---|---|
| Plffs' I (ECF No. 83-22) | Statement of Live Birth for A.J. D.-B., received on or about November 3, 2016 from the Ontario Office of the Registrar General, produced as DVASH-BANKS00000034 | 29, 36, 37 |
| Plffs' J (ECF No. 83-23) | Letter dated January 24, 2017 received in January or February of 2017. The letter is written on the letterhead of the United States Department of State, United States Consulate General, Toronto, and is signed by Frankie Day, produced as DVASH-BANKS00000031. | 74, 75, 162-164 |
| Defs' H (ECF No. 102-1) | Excerpts of <i>Plaintiffs' Responses to Defendants' Requests for Admission</i> | 39 |
| Defs' I (ECF No. 102-2) | Excerpts of <i>Defendants' Responses to Plaintiffs' Requests for Admission</i> | 102, 165, 168-170 |
| Defs' J (ECF No. 102-3) | Excerpts of <i>Defendants' Second Set of Responses to Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories</i> | 171 |
| K (ECF No. 102-4) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of Terri Nathine Francis "Frankie" Day</i> | 63, 65, 70, 77, 79, 80, 83, 114-116, 155, 156 |
| L (ECF No. 102-5) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of Andrew Dvash-Banks</i> | 102, 103 |

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos. ¹ |
|-----------------------------|--|---|
| M (ECF No. 102-6) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of Margaret Ramsay</i> | 157 |
| N (ECF No. 102-7) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of Larilyn Reffett</i> | 56, 60, 138, 172 |
| O (ECF No. 102-8) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of Paul Peek</i> (“30(b)(6) witness”) | 111, 112, 165-167, 170 |
| P (ECF No. 102-9) | DEFS001648-49, August 29, 2014 letter from Consul General, U.S. Embassy Bangkok, describing rationale behind asking for DNA testing at Embassies and Consulates worldwide | |
| Q (ECF No. 103-1) | DEFS001382-84, February 13, 2012 Information Memo to the Secretary on Assisted Reproductive Technology (ART), Citizenship and Visa Law | 138, 172 |
| R (ECF No. 103-2) | Copy of news article published September 6, 2017, by CBS Los Angeles, titled “DNA Dilemma: Baby Can’t Get US Citizenship,” containing statements by Plaintiff Andrew Dvash-Banks | 106 |
| S (ECF No. 103-3) | PDF copy of Immigration Equality webpage titled “Meet the Dvash-Banks Family” | 106 |
| T (ECF No. 103-4) | Complaint filed January 22, 2018 | 106 |

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos. ¹ |
|---|--|--|
| U (ECF No. 110-3) | Excerpts of the <i>Transcript of the Deposition of Paul Peek</i> , Defendant the United States Department of State's designee under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 30(b)(6) | 154, 170, 172 |
| Admin. Record Part 0 ² (ECF No. 80) | Admin Record Certification Page | 67 |
| Admin. Record Part I (ECF No. 80-2) | AR 001: Denial Letter — Letter issued by Vice Consul Terri N. Day denying passport and Consular Report of Birth Abroad applications submitted on behalf of E.J. D-B. | 92, 93 |
| Admin. Record Part II (ECF No. 80-3) | AR 002 – 008: Case Notes — Case notes and related entries associated with the U.S. passport and Consular Report of Birth Abroad applications submitted on behalf of E.J. D-B. | 56, 57, 95, 154 |
| Admin. Record Part III (ECF No. 80-4) | AR 009 – 072: Application Materials — Passport and Consular Report of Birth Abroad applications submitted on behalf of E.J. D-B. | 21, 37, 39, 40, 64, 87, 146, 152, 153, 158-161 |

² At Defendants' request, Plaintiffs include the full Administrative Record here, which is also filed at ECF No. 80 as a standalone document.

Dvash-Banks v. U.S. Department of State
Case No. 2:18-cv-00523

| Ex./Tab | Description | Combined Statement of Facts Nos. ¹ |
|---|--|---|
| Admin. Record Part IV (ECF No. 80-5) | AR 073: Email and attachments — Correspondence from Consul Margaret Ramsay to Vice Consul Terri “Frankie” Day, providing “ART guidance” for adjudication of Plaintiffs’ applications. | 67 |
| Admin. Record Part V (ECF No. 80-6) | AR 074 – 076: Email link content — As noted in email text, “2014 Cable on ART Cases” in the original. | 127, 129, 166 |
| Admin. Record Part VI (ECF No. 80-7) | AR 077 – 080: Email link content — “As noted in email text, “7 FAM 1100 Appendix D” in the original. | 85, 110, 166 |
| Admin. Record Part VII (ECF No. 80-8) | AR 081 – 106: Foreign Affairs Manual (FAM) Provisions — Relevant provisions in effect during the adjudication timeframe (January 24, 2017–March 2, 2017). | 67, 87, 98, 112, 142, 143, 151 |