

16-3592

IN THE
United States Court of Appeals
FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

FREDERICK M. CARGIAN,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

—against—

BREITLING USA, INC.,

Defendant-Appellee.

ON APPEAL FROM THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

**JOINT APPENDIX
VOLUME III OF III
(Pages A-552 to A-804)**

JAMES M. LEMONEDES
ZEV SINGER
FOX ROTHSCHILD LLP
100 Park Avenue, 15th Floor
New York, New York 10017
(212) 878-7900

Attorneys for Defendant-Appellee

JANICE GOODMAN
LAW OFFICE OF JANICE GOODMAN
61 Jane Street, Suite 11D
New York, New York 10014
(212) 869-1940

Attorneys for Plaintiff-Appellant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Docket Entries	A-1
Complaint, dated February 10, 2015.....	A-10
Answer and Affirmative Defenses, dated April 3, 2015.....	A-19
Defendant’s Notice of Motion for Summary Judgment, dated February 29, 2016	A-29
Declaration of Zev Singer in Support of Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment, dated February 29, 2016	A-31
Exhibit A to Singer Declaration— Complaint, dated February 10, 2015	A-37
Exhibit B to Singer Declaration— Declaration of Thierry Prissert, dated February 29, 2016.....	A-47
Exhibit C to Singer Declaration— Declaration of Charles Anderson, dated February 29, 2016.....	A-63
Exhibit D to Singer Declaration— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Frederick M. Carigan, taken on September 17, 2015	A-74
Exhibit E to Singer Declaration— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Thierry Prissert, taken on January 6, 2016.....	A-129
Exhibit F to Singer Declaration— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Sebastien Amstutz, taken on December 9, 2015.....	A-161
Exhibit G to Singer Declaration— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Annie Sommer, taken on January 21, 2016.....	A-172

	PAGE
Exhibit H to Singer Declaration— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Charles Anderson, taken on November 24, 2015	A-183
Exhibit I to Singer Declaration— Plaintiff’s Employment Agreements, 2011-2013	A-197
Exhibit J to Singer Declaration— Periodic Sales Data Emails sent to Breitling	A-212
Exhibit K to Singer Declaration— PowerPoint presentations created by Charles Anderson and presented to the sales representatives at sales meetings	A-221
Exhibit L to Singer Declaration— Email exchange between Marie Bodman and Plaintiff, dated October 19, 2010	A-234
Exhibit M to Singer Declaration— Email exchange between Thierry Prissert and Plaintiff, dated June 14, 2011	A-237
Exhibit N to Singer Declaration— Email from Chuck Anderson to Plaintiff, dated February 15, 2012	A-241
Exhibit O to Singer Declaration— Email from Chuck Anderson to Plaintiff, dated July 16, 2012	A-244
Exhibit P to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated July 23, 2012	A-246
Exhibit Q to Singer Declaration— Email from Chuck Anderson to Plaintiff, dated August 18, 2012 ..	A-249
Exhibit R to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated September 26, 2012	A-251
Exhibit S to Singer Declaration— Email from Chuck Anderson to Plaintiff, dated October 5, 2012...	A-253

Exhibit T to Singer Declaration— Email from Chuck Anderson to Plaintiff, dated March 5, 2013	A-256
Exhibit U to Singer Declaration— Email exchange between Chuck Anderson and Plaintiff, dated May 20, 2013	A-259
Exhibit V to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated June 4, 2013	A-263
Exhibit W to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated September 11, 2013	A-266
Exhibit X to Singer Declaration— Plaintiff’s 2011 Mid-year review	A-269
Exhibit Y to Singer Declaration— Plaintiff’s 2011 Year-end review	A-271
Exhibit Z to Singer Declaration— Plaintiff’s 2012 Year-end review	A-273
Exhibit AA to Singer Declaration— Plaintiff’s 2012 Self-evaluation form	A-275
Exhibit BB to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated September 18, 2012	A-277
Exhibit CC to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated April 9, 2012	A-279
Exhibit DD to Singer Declaration— Northeast 1 territory’s sales results chart (for the territory Plaintiff covered in 2011).	A-281
Exhibit EE to Singer Declaration— Email from Plaintiff to Thierry Prissert, dated December 20, 2011, with attachment	A-283

	PAGE
Exhibit FF to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated July 23, 2012	A-287
Exhibit GG to Singer Declaration— 2012 month-by-month sales results chart for Breitling sales representatives	A-289
Exhibit HH to Singer Declaration— 2012 Northeast 1 territory’s sales results chart (for the territory Plaintiff covered in 2012).	A-291
Exhibit II to Singer Declaration— Email from Thierry Prissert to Plaintiff, dated September 11, 2013	A-293
Exhibit JJ to Singer Declaration— 2013 month-by-month sales results chart for Breitling sales representatives	A-296
Exhibit KK to Singer Declaration— Email from Plaintiff to Monika Pieren, dated March 15, 2011	A-298
Defendant’s Local Rule 56.1 Statement of Undisputed Material Facts, dated February 29, 2016	A-300
Plaintiff’s Rule 56.1 Opposition to Summary Judgment and in Support of his Claim, dated March 28, 2016.	A-325
Affirmation of Janice Goodman in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment, dated March 28, 2016	A-354
Exhibit 1 to Goodman Affirmation— Order of Magistrate Judge Pitman	A-361
Exhibit 2 to Goodman Affirmation— Letter from Zev Singer to Janice Goodman, dated December 18, 2015	A-363
Exhibit 3 to Goodman Affirmation— PowerPoint pages	A-368

	PAGE
Exhibit 4 to Goodman Affirmation— Breitling USA’s Responses and Objections to Plaintiff’s First Request for Admissions, dated January 27, 2016	A-371
Exhibit 5 to Goodman Affirmation— Defendant’s summary charts	A-391
Exhibit 6 to Goodman Affirmation— Intentionally Omitted	A-394
Exhibit 7 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Lisa Roman, taken on June 17, 2015.....	A-395
Exhibit 8 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Melissa Vessely, taken on January 19, 2016.....	A-417
Exhibit 9 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Frederick Cargian, taken on September 17, 2015	A-430
Exhibit 10 to Goodman Affirmation— 2012 PowerPoint presentation	A-454
Exhibit 11 to Goodman Affirmation— Intentionally Omitted	A-457
Exhibit 12 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Annie Sommer, taken on January 21, 2016.....	A-458
Exhibit 13 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Charles Anderson, taken on November 24, 2015	A-486
Exhibit 14 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Isaac Schafrath, taken on July 23, 2015	A-513
Exhibit 15 to Goodman Affirmation— Year-over-year sales comparison (2012/2011).....	A-548

	PAGE
Exhibit 16 to Goodman Affirmation— Year-over-year sales comparison (2013/2012)	A-550
Exhibit 17 to Goodman Affirmation— Breitling collateral material - pin-ups used for marketing	A-552
Exhibit 18 to Goodman Affirmation— Drawing in office of President of Breitling SA	A-557
Exhibit 19 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Sophie Morice, taken on January 19, 2016.....	A-559
Exhibit 20 to Goodman Affirmation— Complaint of sexual discrimination by sales rep Beth Haddad	A-567
Exhibit 21 to Goodman Affirmation— Warning letter from Thierry Prissert to Fred Cragian, dated September 18, 2012	A-570
Exhibit 22 to Goodman Affirmation— Summary of business related to Bentley, 2012/2011	A-572
Exhibit 23 to Goodman Affirmation— Email from Thierry Prissert to Sebastien Amstutz re: Reno incident	A-574
Exhibit 24 to Goodman Affirmation— Email re: Cargian’s unused vacation time, 2012	A-577
Exhibit 25 to Goodman Affirmation— Disciplinary material re: Sales Rep. X Breitling	A-580
Exhibit 26 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Sebastien Amstutz, taken on December 9, 2015.....	A-588
Exhibit 27 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Thierry Prissert, taken on January 6, 2016.....	A-616

	PAGE
Exhibit 28 to Goodman Affirmation— Excerpts of the Deposition Transcript of Diana Figueroa, taken on November 19, 2015	A-624
Exhibit 29 to Goodman Affirmation— Bonus Sheet 2013 for Cargian	A-633
Exhibit 30 to Goodman Affirmation— Order of the Honorable George B. Daniels, dated February 17, 2016 Denying Plaintiff’s request for continuation of Amstutz deposition	A-635
Exhibit 31 to Goodman Affirmation— Resume of Isaac Schafrath	A-638
Exhibit 32 to Goodman Affirmation— Job Description, Vault Manager	A-640
Exhibit 33 to Goodman Affirmation— Breitling Points of Sale 2012	A-642
Exhibit 34 to Goodman Affirmation— Emails reducing reps goals for 2012 and 2013	A-644
Exhibit 35 to Goodman Affirmation— Bonus statements, 2012 for all sales reps	A-657
Exhibit 36 to Goodman Affirmation— Bonus statements, 2013 for all sales reps	A-665
Exhibit 37 to Goodman Affirmation— Letter from Thierry Prissert to Lisa Roman, dated January 20, 2014	A-674
Exhibit 38 to Goodman Affirmation— Warning letter for failure to follow company policies and attitude at work, dated November 11, 2013	A-677
Exhibit 39 to Goodman Affirmation— Letter from Zev Singer to Janice Goodman, dated February 3, 2016	A-678

	PAGE
Exhibit 40 to Goodman Affirmation— Memos of criticism of Lambert work	A-680
Affidavit of Frederick M. Cargian in Opposition to Defendant’s Motion for Summary Judgment, sworn to March 27, 2016.....	A-690
Exhibit A to Cargian Affidavit— Charts, Letter from Marie Bodman.....	A-705
Exhibit B to Cargian Affidavit— Article titled “Hall of Fame Retailers Honored”	A-749
Exhibit C to Cargian Affidavit— Photographs	A-752
Defendant’s Reply to Plaintiff’s Response to Defendant’s Local Rule 56.1 Statement of Undisputed Facts and to Plaintiff’s Counterstatement Pursuant to Local Rule 56.1, dated April 1R8, 2016	A-755
Memorandum Decision and Order of the Honorable George B. Daniels, dated September 29, 2016	A-793
Judgment Appealed From, dated September 29, 2016	A-803
Notice of Appeal, dated October 21, 2016	A-804